



COVER SHEET FOR ASSESSED COURSEWORK

All assessed coursework must be accompanied by this coversheet, which should be included as the first page of your submission. There is space below the coversheet for you to copy and paste your assessment. The contents of the coversheet do not count towards your submission word count. If your work should be marked for content, please use the separate **Mark for Content Coversheet**.

Please complete each of the following sections:-

Student ID: 201057601

Module Code: HIST3500

Module Name: History Dissertation

Tutor's Name: Dr Claire Eldridge

Is this submission group work? If so, please list the other group members' student numbers here:

Please note that by submitting this piece of work you are agreeing to the University's Declaration of Academic Integrity. You can [read the Declaration here](#).

The Touareg in the French
Ethnographic *Imaginaire*
Using and abusing indigeneity to
articulate colonial identities

by
Sara Green

201057601
School of History
University of Leeds
Supervised by Dr Claire Eldridge
2019/2020
Word Count: 13,166.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	1
Introduction	3
Chapter I: Orientalism, Primordialism and the ‘White’ Touareg in Early French Ethnography (1845-1873)	8
I.I Ethnology and Anthropology in the Era of French Pacification of Algeria	8
I.II Touareg ‘Whiteness’ and Faulty Genealogies: Finding the ‘Self’ in the ‘Other’	12
I.III <i>La Belle Femme Targui</i>: Using matriarchy as a foil to <i>La Femme Arabe</i>	20
Chapter II: Recalcitrance, Punitive Ethnography and the Reinforcement of Colonial Difference (1881-1911)	27
II.I The Flatters Expedition (1881): ‘Martyrs of geography’ and the birth of ethnographic crime	27
II.II Post-Flatters Ethnographies: Problematising the failures of Franco-Indigenous assimilation	32
II.III ‘Les Touaregs à Paris’: Decontextualisation, essentialism and punitive ethnographic display	40
Chapter III: Postcoloniality and Knowledge: Reproductions and subversions of ethnic difference in Touareg and Amazigh political consciousness	45
III.I Amazigh Political Consciousness in the Postcolonial Nation: A return to the ‘Triangular’ relationship?	45
III.II. The Touareg in ‘World’ Music: A ‘Third Space’, or strategic essentialism?	52
Conclusion	58
Covid-19 Considerations	62
Bibliography	63

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Dr Claire Eldridge, not only for the wonderful advice and encouragement for this dissertation, but also for showing me what being an outstanding academic looks like; equal measures of intelligence and kindness. Thank you to my partner Sam for the patience, kindness and support.



Image: '*Cavalier Touareg*' The collections room at the Colonial Garden in Nogent-sur-Marne (1928)

Introduction

This dissertation seeks to explore the uses and functions of narratives of the Touareg within the French colonial ethnographic imagination from 1845-1911. The Touareg are one of four Berber ethnic groups of North and West Africa that historically inhabit the central Sahara, whose cultural and social traditions lay at the juncture of key ethnographic myths about indigeneity constructed by the French in Algeria (1830-1962).¹ Much historiographical attention has been paid to the 'Kabyle Myth,' a set of ethnographic binaries that sought to juxtapose the civilisationally 'defective' Arab against the socially 'evolved' of the Kabyles; this myth was predicated on a set of positivist polarities between sedentarism/nomadism, religiosity/secularism, and liberation/oppression.² Patricia Lorcin explores how not only were these myths based on faulty ethnographic assumptions that overwrote the epistemologies and lived realities of both Kabyle and Arab groups, but also highlights how the myth was often a vessel for expressing contemporary hopes and anxieties of French colonial rule.³ Scant historiographical attention has been paid to a similar phenomenon within the ethnographic history of the Touareg under French colonialism; namely, the notion of Touareg exceptionalism, which sought to elevate the Touareg from their indigenous social milieu as a singularly 'White' and essentially 'Christian' people, on a close civilisational footing with the French themselves.

¹ 'The Kabyles, from the region of what is now known as Kabylia, were the largest of four groups of Berbers. The others were the Chaouia of the Aures Mountains in southeastern Algeria, the Mozabites of the Mزاب in the northern Saharan region, and the Tuareg of the central Sahara. The Kabyles resided in the three mountain ranges that today make up Greater and Lesser Kabylia. The remaining ethnic groups were Turks, Kouloughlis (descendants of Turks and North African women), Andalusians (descendants of the Moors exiled from Spain), blacks (mainly soldiers, emancipated slaves, and slaves), Jews, and "infidels" (non-Muslim slaves and renegades, many of whom held high office under Turkish occupation).' in Patricia Lorcin, 'Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race in Algeria, 1830-1870: The Role of the French Medical Corps,' *Isis*, 90:4 (1999) 653-679 (p. 654).

² Patricia Lorcin, *Imperial Identities: Stereotyping, Prejudice and Race in Colonial Algeria* (London: I. B. Tauris, 1999) p. 12.

³ Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, *ibid.*

Seminal works in the history of colonial thought delineate how a ‘rule of colonial difference’ between the colonizer and the colonized was a fundamental aspect of maintaining, perpetuating and rationalising an inherently exploitative social dynamic.⁴ Edward Said’s *Orientalism* was instrumental in highlighting the role of ‘soft’ colonial powers in perpetuating this ‘Self’ and ‘Other’ dichotomy; it was literature, the arts and emergent scientific fields such as ethnography, that would construct an ‘imaginative geography’ of the Orient that acted as an epistemic foil to the ‘enlightened’ White, European self.⁵ Under this model, what is the function of this ethnographic proximity between French and Touareg culture? Anthropologist Paul Pandolfi presents a modification of Said’s theory that designates The Touareg as a space of negotiation between the European Self and the Arab/Black ‘Other,’ creating a relationship ‘not dual, but triangular.’⁶

Using this framework, Chapter I will explore the conception of the Touareg myth of exceptionalism, arguing that it served a strictly *strategic* and *rhetorical* role in articulating a French sense of Self within a colonial context. Though ostensibly ‘sympathetic’ to the Touareg –especially when juxtaposed with pejorative contemporary accounts of their Arab counterparts –it was nonetheless part of an epistemically violent process of using and abusing indigeneity to legitimate French rule.⁷ Just as the romanticisation of the sedentary Kabyles fostered a sense of French colonial primordialism, a fictive cultural and geo-historical connection that made the French ‘at home’ in a colonial context, this same primordial rationale was brought south to the Sahara to similarly rationalise and naturalise burgeoning French political expansion.

⁴ See: Partha Chatterjee, *The Nation and Its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993)

⁵ See: Edward Said, *Orientalism* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1978)

⁶ Pandolfi, Paul, ‘L’imagerie touarègue entre littérature savante et littérature populaire’ *L’Année du Maghreb*, 7 (2011) 101-113.

⁷ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, *Can the Subaltern Speak?* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1988)

Chapter II will build upon this notion of ethnographic ‘favour’ as being inherently epistemically violent by revealing its contingency on total docility to French military and political hegemony. A singular incident of Touareg recalcitrance (The Flatters Expedition, 1881) would ideologically undermine not only the dynamic of white colonial privilege –still invariably at work even in instances of strategic proximity to indigenous groups –but also the crude ‘colonial vulgate’ by which French military was blindsided in their assumption of Touareg docility. George Trumbull delineates that this breach of ethnographic ‘trust’ represented a deep trauma for French self esteem, prompting a punitive and vengeful reaction seeking to ‘discipline and publish.’⁸ Invoking the Foucauldian notion of modern discipline as being ‘put on stage,’ the role of ethnography as a punitive, and again, ‘imaginative,’ process will be explored. In extending this notion outlined by Trumbull to also examine the ways in which contemporary academic and social debates also manifested in this ‘ethnographic punishment’ –namely, the notion that the failure of Franco-Algerian assimilation resulted in a reinforcement of colonial difference –we see a common thread between these seemingly opposing narratives of Touareg ‘civility’ and subsequent assertions of Touareg cultural ‘criminality.’ This common thread being that, whether being ‘used’ or ‘abused,’ the Touareg in the French ethnographic *imaginaire* was a vessel for developing articulations of the French ‘Self’ in the colonial context.

Methodologically, this dissertation will approach French ethnography with a postcolonial and historicist perspective that expresses scepticism of the ability of universalist narratives and binaries, such as the White - Touareg - Arab/Black gradation outlined by Pandolfi, to encapsulate the historical and political nuances actually at play in the history of the Touareg under colonialism. It will also draw upon the postcolonial historiographical

⁸ George R. Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts: Colonial Power, Cultural Knowledge, and Islam in Algeria, 1870–1914* (Cambridge; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2009) p. 210.

works of those such as Bernard Cohn, whose approach to colonial knowledge(s) combines a meticulous tracing of the ‘careers’ of slippery concepts such as caste, class, ‘tribe’ and ‘type,’ with an anthropological approach to the nature of colonial rule itself. This allows the historian, without justifying inequitable colonial dynamics, to fully contextualise colonial knowledge construction as it relates to fomenting notions of white French identities in a colonial space; finding, rather than a singular ‘Self’ and ‘Other’ binary, a broad, fluid and often contradictory set of negotiations of the colonial rationale.⁹ We nonetheless find that these processes, whether reinforcing colonial proximities or differences, are inherently, *epistemically* violent; as Said argues, knowledge of indigeneity was rendered ‘“credible only after pass[ing] through [...] the refining fire of the Orientalist’s work.”¹⁰ This notion of the inability of the colonized subject to ‘speak,’ a central problem within the historiographical work of the Subaltern Studies group, can be interpreted pessimistically as an admission that only white colonial perspectives are available for historical examination. Though this dissertation does ultimately validate the idea that authentic Touareg self-representation was, indeed, virtually impossible under a model of French epistemic dominance, I instead hope to trace the genealogies and inheritances of ethnographic Touareg myths into the postcolonial era in Chapter III. This aims not only to redress a historical epistemic imbalance and metaphorically allow the Subaltern Touareg to ‘speak,’ but to contribute originally to the existing historiography by fully problematizing the postcolonial impacts of colonial ‘conquests of knowledge.’¹¹

⁹ Nicholas Dirks, ‘foreword’ in *Colonialism and its forms of knowledge: the British in India*, Bernard S Cohn (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996).

¹⁰ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 283:

¹¹ See: Cohn, *Colonialism and its forms of knowledge*.

Chapter I: Orientalism, Primordialism and the ‘White’ Touareg in Early French Ethnography (1845 -1873)

I.I Ethnology and Anthropology in the Era of French Pacification of Algeria

It is certainly not novel to call attention to the relationship between ethnographic enquiry and colonial power; Foucault’s notion of knowledge construction being a circular legitimization of power relations is often the foundation of a plethora of postcolonial analyses.¹² However, it is still essential to historicise the unique role that ethnography played in the context of the Pacification of Algeria under Military rule (1830-1871). Ostensibly, the notion that peaceful participatory ethnographic observation coexisted with ‘scorched earth’ pacification campaigns –considered by scholars of genocide such as Ben Kiernan as part of a broader campaign of ‘genocidal hatred’ –appears contradictory.¹³ However, the extent to which Orientalist ethnographic assumptions were preformed, rather than constituting an *ex post facto* justification of colonial dominance, may explain this interrelation of ethnography and military force in early colonial policy.¹⁴ Indeed, the assumption of Arab barbarity and their especially vicious and violent practices of war – dating back to the somewhat fictitious notion of the Algerian barbary pirate, which provided part of the rationale for French invasion in 1830 – was used to set the tone for exceptional French violence during pacification.¹⁵ Diplomat and political thinker Alexis de Tocqueville’s discourse on the Conquest of Algeria (1841) surmised that French conduct was ‘more barbarous than the Arabs themselves;’ this violence, that was viewed domestically as dislocated from

¹² See: Michel Foucault, *The Will to Knowledge: The History of Sexuality Volume 1* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978) (trans. Robert Hurley) p. 139.

¹³ Ben Kiernan, *Blood and Soil: A World History of Genocide and Extermination from Sparta to Darfur* (New Haven, Conn: Yale University Press, 2007) p. 374.

¹⁴ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 39: “To say simply that Orientalism was a rationalization of colonial rule is to ignore the extent to which colonial rule was justified in advance by Orientalism, rather than after the fact.”

¹⁵ Gillian Weiss, *Captives and Corsairs: France and Slavery in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2011) ‘Chapter 8: The Conquest of Algiers’ pp. 156-170 (p. 158).

contemporary notions of French civilisational sophistication, is rationalized by de Tocqueville as an ‘unfortunate necessity.’¹⁶ In being ‘obliged to submit’ to the supposedly ‘barbaric’ Arab practices of warfare, we can glean the utility of an ethnographic myth in bolstering the legitimacy of colonial power, and violence that cannot even be ‘sold’ wholesale to a metropolitan population with a preconception of European superiority.¹⁷ These ‘formative’ years for French ethnography of Algeria, according to George Trumbull, established a ‘discrete realm’ for colonial intervention in indigenous life.¹⁸

Another feature of these formative decades of French ethnography was the elevation of particular ethnic groups to various extents of ‘civility,’ and thus, proximity to the French. Historiographical focus has leaned towards Algerian Jews, whose naturalisation through the Crémieux Decree of 24 October 1870 predated even the naturalisation of European settlers (1889 and 1893), and the ‘Kabyle Myth’ that distinguished the Berber ethnic group from the ‘volatility’ of Algerian Arabs.¹⁹ Earlier historiographical interpretations cite this elevation as a simple political mechanism, a Machiavellian *divide ut imperes* applied arbitrarily as a mode of domination.²⁰ Though ethnographies of the Touareg feature less prominently in this debate in the Anglophone literature, the extremes of proximity to European ‘civilisation’ suggested in the ethnographic works of Henri Duveyrier – emphatically stating their ‘fundamental’ ethnic typology as White, European and Christian – suggests a more complex process was at play in the construction of ethnic genealogies.²¹ Besides articulating and perpetuating

¹⁶ Alexis de Tocqueville, *Writings on Empire and Slavery* ed. and trans by Jennifer Pitts (Baltimore, Maryland: John Hopkins University Press, 2001) - ‘Essay on Algeria, October 1941’ p. 70.

¹⁷ de Tocqueville, *Essay on Algeria*, *ibid.*

¹⁸ George R. Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts: Colonial Power, Cultural Knowledge, and Islam in Algeria, 1870–1914* (Cambridge; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2009) p. 2.

¹⁹ Patricia Lorcin, ‘Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race in Algeria, 1830-1870: The Role of the French Medical Corps,’ *Isis*, 90:4 (1999) 653-679 (p. 669).

²⁰ Patricia Lorcin, *Imperial Identities: Stereotyping, Prejudice and Race in Colonial Algeria* (London: I. B. Tauris, 1999) p. 12.

²¹ See: Henri Duveyrier, *Les Touareg du Nord* (Paris: Challamel aîné, 1864).

colonial power, ethnography was equally a theoretical space in which to explore French identity within a colonial context. Whilst the spectre of Mediterranean barbary piracy was initially captivating as a rationale for French invasion (1830), a more sustained logic of French presence was necessary to legitimate both excesses of violence and burgeoning settler colonisation.²² Therefore, just as 'imaginative' processes of nation-building historicise and codify a primordial sense of national identity, a form of colonial primordialism came to prominence in the conceptualisation of a 'French Mediterranean.'²³ Great significance was ascribed to surviving Greco-Roman monuments as an indication of Franco-Algerian geo-historical cohesion, signifying to the French a precedent for the 'unification' of the Mediterranean, 'bathing it in the font of scientific advancement and a universal, 'natural' law which superseded individual differences of language and custom.'²⁴ Silverstein outlines that the French *mission civilisatrice* ideology often cloaked itself in the aesthetics and semantics of the 'lumière' of classical civilisations, creating conjoint secular and religious logics for French colonisation.²⁵ This contextual backdrop is significant in understanding the academic and ideological interest in 'discovering' the Touareg as a white, essentially 'Christian' race with theoretical Roman Getule ancestry.²⁶

Methodological considerations are also significant in understanding the production of ethnographic knowledge in early colonial Algeria. French ethnographic theory was significantly distinguished from its Anglo-American counterparts, whose focus on

²² Weiss, *Captives and Corsairs*, p. 167.

²³ See: Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (Verso: London, 2006)

Paul A. Silverstein, 'France's *Mare Nostrum*: colonial and post-colonial constructions of the French Mediterranean,' *The Journal of North African Studies*, 7:4 (2000) 1-22 (p. 2).

²⁴ Silverstein, *France's Mare Nostrum*, pp. 2-3.

See also: Michael Greenhalgh, 'The New Centurions: French Reliance on the Roman Past During the Conquest of Algeria,' *War & Society*, 16:1 (1998) 1-28.

²⁵ Silverstein, *France's Mare Nostrum*, p. 3.

²⁶ See: Jean-André-Napoléon Périer, 'Des races dites berbères et de leur ethnogénie,' *Mémoires de la société d'anthropologie* (1873) 1-54.

craniological typology formed an absolute and immutable predictor of racial ‘behaviours’ – invariably validating the ‘natural’ and racially prescribed dynamic of slavery.²⁷ Academic and professionalized French ethnography similarly took race to be a determinative element of a cohesive study of humankind, whilst maintaining a holistic study of linguistic, moral, intellectual and historical characteristics.²⁸ Definitively monogenetic in its approach to humankind as of the same fundamental ‘race,’ the pioneer of this school, William Frédéric Edwards (founder, Société Ethnologique de Paris, 1839-1862), took particular interest of facial phenotypes as opposed to craniology, as a method to ‘strip away’ centuries of intra-ethnic ‘mixing’ to reveal pure racial genealogies.²⁹ Though this is problematic by modern anthropological standards, by which the attempt to ‘erase’ social-cultural influences and hybridities is evidently faulty, it left ethnographers ample conceptual space to transpose and articulate contemporary anxieties of rule onto racial genealogies. This malleability of ethnographic ‘type’ also had its pragmatic functions; Lorcin outlines that successive indigenous revolts, namely the Arab-led revolts of Abd-al-Qadr (1835-37, 1839-47) and the Campaign of Kabylie (1857), created a 27-year continuity of ‘one or the other’ of the two groups in open conflict with the French, a fact which ‘coloured’ their portrayal in the colonial imaginary.³⁰ Therefore, whilst it might be tempting to view earlier participative ethnographies as decidedly ‘sympathetic’ in its portrayals of the Kabyles or Touaregs, their being contingent on political docility to the French reveal the innately political function of ethnographic enquiry. These are early indications of Trumbull’s notion of ‘punitive ethnography,’ which would take centre stage following 1881 as an expression of both social pessimism at the ‘failure’ of Franco-indigenous assimilation, and a reflection of the rise of a

²⁷ Alice L. Conklin, *In the Museum of Man: Race, Anthropology, and Empire in France, 1850-1950* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2013) p. 23.

²⁸ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, p. 24.

²⁹ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, *ibid.*

³⁰ Lorcin, *Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race*, p. 667.

more decidedly racialised and polygenic practice of anthropology.³¹ Therefore, without neglecting the key academic and theoretical developments in the field, we nonetheless find a common thread of the articulation of colonial power as a key function of all iterations of French anthropological practice.

I.II Touareg ‘Whiteness’ and Faulty Genealogies: Finding the ‘Self’ in the ‘Other’

Initial French encounters with Saharan and Sahelian groups, despite predating the formalisation and professionalisation of racial theory, were nonetheless approached with racialized frameworks that were assumed fit for purpose in ‘knowing’ the ethnically vast and multiplicitous region. ‘Incidental’ proto-ethnographers within the military, whose studies of indigenous groups were often a mere by-product of collecting pertinent military intel, approached the Sahel with a set of ‘dichotomous and mutually exclusive’ labels; namely black/white, master/slave, and nomad/sedentary.³² These polarities, inherited from rationalisations of the trans-Atlantic slave trade, were instrumental in imagining the Touareg, whose light complexion was interpreted as indicative and predictive of an ‘enlightened’ ethnic character.³³ Therefore, in subsequent ethnographies of the Touareg and their cultural ‘mores,’ the prestige of whiteness *itself* was at stake. Edward Said emphasises the entanglement of white European identity in its interpretation of the ‘Orient’; the European ‘Self’ often imaginatively constructed an Otherised ‘foil’ by which to measure and extol its own virtues.³⁴ This entanglement is made more poignant in the case of the ‘White’ Touareg, and thus the ‘imaginative’ process was more extreme; historian Bruce Hall exclaims ‘I cannot

³¹ Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, pp. 172-173.

³² Bruce S. Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa, 1600-1960* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014) p. 109.

See also: Jean Michaud, “‘Incidental’ Ethnographers: French Catholic Missionson the Tonkin-Yunnan Frontier, 1880-1930 (Leiden, 2007).

³³ Martin S Staum., *Labelling People: French Scholars on Society, Race and Empire 1815-1848* (London: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2003) p. 123.

³⁴ See: Said, *Orientalism*.

think of a people other than the Touareg from whom so much was expected on the basis of so little actual exposure and experience.’³⁵

This deficiency in actual exposure is evident in the first French comprehensive study on the Sahara, Eugène Daumas’ *Le Sahara algérien* (1845), whose study of the Touareg comprises a ‘summary [of] scattered notes provided to us by a hundred Arabs who all had seen the Touareg.’³⁶ Daumas, a French officer acting as head of the colony’s entire *affaires arabes* program (1841-50), dedicated this study to the Governor General of Algeria in the hopes of establishing a geographical and ethnographic knowledge with which to ‘penetrate’ French rule over the southern regions.³⁷ Reliant on exclusively Arab sources, despite the prevalence of localised Arab-Touareg power struggles and skirmishes, Daumas nonetheless confidently establishes pejorative ethnic tropes that would later be enshrined as features of Touareg ‘whiteness.’

*The Tuareg claim to be descended from the Turks; we believe it useless to discuss this opinion, probably owing to an attempt to bolster their self-esteem, because they despise the Arabs, whom they treat as a defeated people.*³⁸ (Author’s emphasis)

Though the historical veracity of this claim to Turkish ancestry is virtually unverifiable, being third-hand information sourced from a group with competing material interests with the Touareg, it certainly sets the tone for ‘imaginative’ ethnography wherein indigenous self-representation was necessarily overwritten to serve as a vessel for colonial

³⁵ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, ibid.

³⁶ Eugène Daumas, *Le Sahara algérien: études géographiques, statistiques et historiques sur la région au sud des établissements français en Algérie* ed. by Chancel de Ausone (Paris:Langlois et Leclerq, 1845) p. 324.

³⁷ See: Daumas, *Le Sahara algérien*, dedicace (dedication).

³⁸ Original French: ‘*Les Touareg prétendent descendre des Turcs; nous croyons inutile de discuter cette opinion accréditée sans doute par leur amour-propre, car ils affectent de mépriser les Arabes qu’ils traitent en peuple vaincu.*’ In Daumas, *Le Sahara algérien*, p. 324.

articulations of identity and race.³⁹ Daumas instead turns to the Arab reports of the Touareg as “White as a Christian” – no doubt a simple attempt to frame the description in terms that a European recipient would understand, this description would proliferate in later works as an indication of a European ancestry.⁴⁰ Though Daumas’ rudimentary work was not as ‘glowing’ a picture of the Touareg as those that followed, it propagated a final myth that would later serve to ‘elevate’ the Touareg from other Sahelian groups – the notion that they were Islamic ‘in name only.’⁴¹ Drawn from (faulty) Arab reports that ‘they pray rarely [...] on the days of the major Islamic festivals, instead of praying, they rejoice by simulating fights,’ displaying an overriding ‘contempt for the Quran.’⁴² Although Daumas simply reproduces these accounts without extensive comment, the equivocation of Islam, Arab-ness and moral and civilizational latency was already underway in French ethnographic thought – in creating an Arab-Touareg diametric opposition, bolstered by the alienation of the Touareg from their Muslim identity, Daumas sets the stage for the use of the Touareg to juxtapose supposedly defective Arab traits.⁴³ Pandolfi names this the ‘triangular relationship’ in the history of Touareg stereotyping; wherein the Touareg were not only tempered by a lens of European

³⁹ See: Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, *Can the Subaltern Speak?* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1988) for a foundational text on how the indigenous body, especially those of women, was appropriated to articulate colonial anxieties and identities. Her musings on whether this epistemic erasure can truly allow the ‘Subaltern’ to ‘speak’ in a postcolonial context, a debate that will be explored in relation to the Touareg in Chapter III.

⁴⁰ Daumas, *Le Sahara algerien*, pp. 326-27.

⁴¹ Daumas, *Le Sahara algerien*, p. 327.

⁴² Original French: ‘*Leur religion est la musulmane; mais ils prient peu, ne jeûnent point, ne font point les ablutions ordonnées... Aux jours des grandes fêtes de l’islamisme, au lieu de faire des prières, ils se réjouissent par des combats simulés, par des essais de petite guerre, qu’ils mettent en pratique à la première occasion. Ils n’ont, en un mot, de musulmans que le titre, et il serait difficile qu’il en fût autrement au milieu de la vie sans cesse agitée qu’ils mènent. Ce mépris du Koran et la terreur qu’ils inspirent aux Arabes n’ont pas peu contribué sans doute à exagérer leur détestable réputation.*’ in Daumas, *Le Sahara algérien*, p. 327.

⁴³ See: M. Cuvellier, ‘Remarques physiologiques et médicales sur les Arabes et les Européens faites en Algérie’, cited in Lorcin, *Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race*, p. 663.

colonial discourse, but also configured through, and in opposition to, Arab and Black identities.⁴⁴

This 'triangle' was articulated further by the ethnographic works of Henri Ducapitaine's *Notions ethnographiques sur les berbères Touaregs* (1864) in citing the genealogical 'purity' of the Touareg, 'free from all foreign influence,' as being particularly well suited to acting as a buffer to mediate the 'the human butcheries' of 'sultans kings and negro chiefs.'⁴⁵ This systemisation of complex Sahelian relations into an Arab - Touareg - 'Black' triangle, with the Touareg effectively acting as a proxy for the civilising, 'rationalising' influence of the French, Aucapitaine uses this largely speculative and reductive ethnography to simulate greater French control over the region than actually existed at the time.⁴⁶ In colonial discourse, 'knowing' and 'seeing' a colonized person was an exertion of power – in the Foucauldian sense of putting a purportedly 'delinquent' body on display as a means to surveille it, in the hopes that the subject would correct its 'deviant' behaviour to a standard of French 'respectability.'⁴⁷ By simulating this level of control over, and 'knowledge' of, Sahelian relations, narratives such as Ducapitaine's inserted themselves, as 'civilizers,' through the Touareg, quelling contemporary anxieties of banditry and

⁴⁴ See: Paul Pandolfi, 'Les Touaregs et nous: Une relation triangulaire,' *Revue ethnologies comparées*, 2 (2001).

⁴⁵ Original French: '*Une des conséquences inévitables et bienfaisantes de la révolution politique et religieuse opérée par les Berbères ou sous leur influence immédiate chez les noirs du bassin du Niger sera la fin de ces épouvantables boucheries humaines auxquelles se livrent les sultans rois et chefs nègres, quand ils ne trouvent pas le placement immédiat de leurs razzias.*' in Henri Aucapitaine, 'Notions ethnographiques sur les berbères Touaregs,' *Le Globe: Revue genevoise de géographie*, 4 (1864) 1-53 (p. 2).

⁴⁶ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, 108-110..

John Strachan, 'Murder in the Desert: Soldiers, Settlers and the Flatters Expedition in the Politics and Historical Memory of European Colonial Algeria, 1830-1881' *French History and Civilization*, 4:1 (2011) 210-222 (p. 211).

⁴⁷ Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison* (New York: Vintage Books, 1977) p. 135 'docile bodies.'

recalcitrance that plagued the planned expansion of French rule into the Sahara and Niger bend.⁴⁸

The most authoritative ethnographic text exploring the Touareg is Henri Duveyrier's *Les Touaregs du Nord* (1864); Duveyrier's Saint-Simonian philosophical background sets him apart from his military ethnographer contemporaries, approaching the Touareg purely for the production of ethnographic knowledge – as opposed to a hybridisation of ethnography and military intel.⁴⁹ Michael Heffernan defines Saint-Simonianism a form of proto-socialism which approached the colonial setting with a utopian ideal of 'peaceful commercial exchange between Africa and Europe'; the truly participatory nature of Duveyrier's study reflects this ideal of mutual epistemological exchange.⁵⁰ Despite this more utopian epistemological approach, there is no removing Duveyrier's perspective from its colonial context; as Staum outlines, specifically colonial ethnography, no matter how 'sympathetic,' 'depends upon the idea of having an empire.'⁵¹ This empire, however, could be envisioned in a multitude of ways; Duveyrier, in accepting the essentially 'Caucasian' nature of the Touareg on account of their light skin, uses this to envision a primordial notion of Franco-indigenous proximity.⁵² Duveyrier uses the physical anthropology pioneered by William Frederic Edwards to assign racial meaning to Touareg facial features; deemed Caucasian by virtue of their 'oval face,

⁴⁸ See: Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, Chapter IV, 'Conlonial Conquest and Statecraft in the Niger Bend, c. 1893-1936.'

⁴⁹ Michael Heffernan, 'The Limits of Utopia: Henri Duveyrier and the Exploration of the Sahara in the Nineteenth Century,' *The Geographical Journal*, 155:3 (1989) 342-352 (p. 347).

⁵⁰ Heffernan, *The Limits of Utopia*, p. 342.

⁵¹ Martin Staum, 'Nature and Nurture in French Ethnography and Anthropology, 1859-1914,' *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 65: 3 (2004) 475-495 (p. 475).

Edward Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (New York, 1993) p. 11, cited in Daniel J. Sherman, "The Arts and Sciences of Colonialism," *French Historical Studies*, 23:4 (2000) 707-729 (p. 710).

⁵² Duveyrier, *Les Touaregs du Nord*, p. 381.

elongated among some, round among others; large forehead, black eyes, small nose, protruding cheekbones, medium size mouth, fine lips, beautiful white teeth.’⁵³

Duveyrier was instrumental in connecting this supposed whiteness to a ‘secret’ Christian cultural essence, only ‘lightly’ touched by processes of Arab Islamization. Touareg cultural aspects were transfigured through a limiting lens of European feudal history; their incidental use of cross motifs, their monogamy, their perceived loyalty and integrity, all interpreted as hallmarks of an essentially Christian ‘spirit.’⁵⁴ Somewhat paradoxically, Duveyrier cites the prevalence of *marabouts* (a Maghrebi Muslim leader and mystic) in Touareg society – specifically their itinerant activities, which are likened to Christian missionary – as an indication of greater Touareg proximity to a Christian rather than Muslim heritage.⁵⁵ He concludes, rhetorically: ‘Isn’t French civilisation, of which we are rightly proud, also the work of [...] enlightened bishops of the Middle Ages?’⁵⁶ There is a great deal to unpack within this; how does Duveyrier, after observing a supposedly ‘rare’ Touareg commitment to Islamic practice, construe this as further evidence of a Christian ‘residue?’⁵⁷ Said denotes this epistemological rigidity as an innate feature of colonial knowledge construction; indigenous epistemologies and cultures were rendered ‘credible only after [they] had passed through [...] the refining fire of the Orientalist’s work’ – this ‘refining fire’ being an invariably White Euro-Christian perspective.⁵⁸ By this process, indigenous cultural features were only significant in their ability to be likened to European precepts and precedents. However, the extent to which the Touareg were ‘imagined’ into White Christians

⁵³ Duveyrier, *Les Touareg du Nord*, p. 382.

Translation taken from Bruce Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, p. 125.

⁵⁴ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, p. 124.

⁵⁵ Duveyrier, *Les Touareg du Nord*, p. 341.

⁵⁶ Duveyrier, *Les Touareg du Nord*, *ibid.*

⁵⁷ Duveyrier, *Les Touareg du Nord*, *ibid.* See also: Daumas, *Le Sahara algerien*, p. 327.

⁵⁸ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 283: ‘Evidence of the Orient was credible only after it had passed through and been made firm by the refining fire of the Orientalist’s work.’

surely denotes a deeper desire for a level of proximity between Frenchness and indigeneity that would provide a natural rationale for French political domination of the region.⁵⁹ This was finally fleshed out into a racialised theory, therefore made immutable in the eyes of academic ethnography, by Joanny-Napoléon Périér's *Des races dites berbères et de leur ethnogénie* (1873). As an 'armchair' ethnography synthesising the works of those such as Daumas and Duveyrier, Périér concludes the racial distinction between Kabyles and Touaregs; the former being of ancient Libyan descent, and the Touareg descending from Getules.⁶⁰ He further notes:

*It is strange, however, that Isidore of Seville brought the Gothic Gétules under the name of Goets. This reminds us that, according to certain indications, we believed to be able to assimilate also the name of Gétules to that of Gaëls and identify among themselves and with the Ligurian peoples that these names represent.*⁶¹ (Author's emphasis)

In speculating on the semantic parallels between Getule and Gael, Périér elevates the racial prestige of the Touareg as originally of Indo-European descent as even above the Kabyles, following that 'we also see that the culture of the mind and scientific concepts are generally less neglected among the Touaregs than among the Kabyles.'⁶² This was the most overtly racialised connection between ethnic ancestry and cultural 'traits' to date, and a final step in constructing a cohesive image of an enlightened Touareg whose proximity to French civilisation, as a 'culture of the mind,' was not only self-evident, but racially prescribed.⁶³

⁵⁹ Silverstein, *France's Mare Nostrum*, pp. 3-4.

⁶⁰ Joanny-Napoléon Périér, *Des races dites berbères et de leur ethnogénie*, *Mémoires de la Société d'Anthropologie de Paris*, 1-55 (Paris, 1873).

⁶¹ Périér, *Des races dites berbères*, p. 7.

⁶² Original French: '*Nous voyons aussi que la culture de l'esprit, les notions sur les sciences, sont en général moins négligées chez les Touareg que chez les Kabyles.*' in Périér, *Des races dites berbères*, p. 30.

⁶³ Périér, *Des races dites berbères*, *ibid.*

Patricia Lorcin notes Périer's works as 'examples of the unscientific ideas that were being presented as truth to scholarly societies' during the 1860s-70s, no doubt aiming to satisfy a metropolitan desire for confirmation of their faith in indigenous assimilability to French societal norms.⁶⁴ It also served a deeply ideological role; the incidental 'whiteness' of the Touareg, initially observed through descriptive ethnology, was retroactively rationalised through religious, cultural and genealogical connections to the colonial 'Self.' The Touareg thus emerged as civilisationally close to French culture, so as to not compromise the integrity of preordained racial hierarchies arbitrarily based on skin colour and facial phenotypes.⁶⁵ This proximity also served a political and psychological function, which had been deployed previously; Kabyle culture – deemed as having traditional remnants of 'our [European] Middle Ages, traits which we have since forgotten' – was appropriated to demonstrate a history of 'trans-Mediterranean unity,' in turn providing a comfortable psychological rationale for the excesses of violence as a necessary part of 'recovering' this historical unity.⁶⁶ The elevation of the 'White' Touareg, then, offered the same primordial rationale for burgeoning French expansion in the Sahara as an extension of this historical 'unity.'

Ultimately, Chatterjee's notion of a 'rule of colonial difference' as integral to imperial hegemony is compromised here; processes of knowledge construction could, in fact, use strategic proximity to indigenous culture as a creative means with which to naturalise their own presence in a colonial context – alternatively, finding one's 'Self' within the colonial 'Other.'⁶⁷

I.III La Belle Femme Tarqui: Using matriarchy as a foil to La Femme Arabe

⁶⁴ Lorcin, *Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race*, p. 673.

⁶⁵ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, p. 109.

⁶⁶ Silverstein, *France's Mare Nostrum*, p. 6.

⁶⁷ See: Said, *Orientalism*.

See also: Partha Chatterjee, *The Nation and Its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993)

Having established the role of Touareg ‘whiteness’ as a vessel for French articulations of self-image within a colonial context, another key component of Pandolfi’s ‘Triangular relationship’ was the use of the Touareg as a foil for Black and Arab stereotyping. This juxtaposition was played out on the body of Touareg women; the Touareg practice of matrilineality, both through syncretic religious worship with allusions to ‘matrilineal spirits, fertility, menstruation, the earth and ancestresses’, coupled with the transmission of social and familial status through the female line, captured French imaginations of the supposedly ‘Christian’ essence of Touareg society.⁶⁸ This assumption is categorically faulty; not only was contemporary French society virtually incomparable to such a matriarchal model, but postcolonial anthropologists highlight Maghrebi Sufism (a form of Islamic mysticism) as a likely influence on such syncretic religious and social practices.⁶⁹ However, we return to Bruce Hall’s assertion that approaches to the Muslim Sahel were largely preordained *before* any meaningful contact or exposure; one of these being the irrevocably patriarchal and oppressive nature of Islam on women’s social position.⁷⁰ This notion proliferated in earlier studies of Kabylia, namely Daumas’ *La Grande Kabylie* (1847), wherein the lack of veiling practices and ostensible freedom of Kabyle women was established as a result of a ‘lighter’ process of Islamisation.⁷¹ Daumas subsequently consecrated this theory of indigenous social life in *La Femme Arabe* (Likely composed in 1871, published 1912), tracing the life-cycle of an Arab woman to reveal their supposed subjugation under the yoke of Arabo-Islamic patriarchy at every stage, a patriarchy that deliberately sought to ‘cloister’ women from French assimilatory influences.⁷² A fixation on veiling, visualised by Daumas as a site of

⁶⁸ Susan J. Rasmussen, ‘Tuareg’ in *Encyclopedia of World Culture, Volume 9: Africa and the Middle East*, ed. by David Levinson (London: G K Hall, 1996).

⁶⁹ Harry T. Norris, *The Tuaregs: Their Islamic Legacy and Its Diffusion in the Sahel* (London: Warminster, 1976) pp. 1–4.

⁷⁰ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, pp. 108–111.

⁷¹ See: Eugène Daumas, *La Grande Kabylie* (Paris: Hachette, 1847).

⁷² Eugène Daumas, *La femme arabe* (Alger: A. Jourdan, 1912) p. 2. Published posthumously (deceased in 1871).

concealing ‘moral sickness’ and primitive ‘mores, customs and ideas,’ is part of a broader shift within the French colonial imaginary; the concealed female body, once a site of Oriental eroticism in earlier depictions, was now problematised as a site of ethnographic enquiries of cultural ‘deficiencies’ – of which Islam was often painted as the cause.⁷³ This ‘gradation’ of Islamization having been established as a means to measure a culture’s ‘civility,’ the notion of the ‘progressive’ Touareg matriarchy being of Islamic origin troubled this preordained binary. Thus, once again, indigenous self-representation was overwritten by ethnographers such as Duveyrier to appropriate the Touareg woman as ‘Christian,’ their unveiled bodies acting as an exemplary ‘foil’ to the *Femme Arabe* archetype.

Duveyrier’s captivation with aesthetic parallels between European and Touareg women serves one of the most compelling aspects of his entire argument of the Christianity of the Touareg, especially to a French academic audience with a fixation on the predictive nature of facial anthropology.⁷⁴ His *Journal de route* (1863) details an initial encounter:

I received the welcome visit of three ladies, one of whom is young, quite tall and of a rare whiteness; she is also very well groomed. Her hairstyle is identical on the front to our flat European headbands, but the latter end behind the ears with two short and thick mats. The ornaments of these Touareg are sober; the beautiful one wears three light bracelets on each arm; it is overall tasteful and would be well seen in Europe.

So these are no longer the crude ornaments of the Arabs.⁷⁵ (Author’s emphasis)

⁷³ Daumas, *La femme arabe*, ibid.

⁷⁴ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, pp. 19-29.

⁷⁵ Original French: ‘Je reçois la visite bienvenue de trois dames targuies, l’une d’elles est jeune, assez grande et d’une blancheur rare; elle est de plus très bien peignée. Sa coiffure est, sur le devant, identique à nos bandeaux plats d’Europe, mais ces derniers se terminent derrière les oreilles par deux nattes courtes et épaisses. Les ornements de ces Targuiât sont sobres; la belle porte trois légers bracelets à chaque bras; le tout est de bon goût et serait bien vu en Europe. Ainsi ce ne sont plus les ornements grossiers des Arabes.’ in Henri Duveyrier, *Sahara algérien et tunisien. Journal de route de Henri Duveyrier*, published and annotated by Ch. Maunoir et H. Schirmer, ed. by Augustin Challamel (Paris: Librairie Maritime et Coloniale, 1905) p. 167.

The full extent of the ‘Triangular’ relationship by which the Touareg were imagined is evident here; not only is the concept of the innate sophistication of whiteness validated through the celebration of ‘tasteful,’ essentially ‘European’ jewellery and ornamentation, but they are also necessarily juxtaposed with those of Arab women.⁷⁶ The extent to which this was a product of colonial thinking itself is worth considering; the influence of positivism, explored by philosophers such as Auguste Comte, advocated the existence of universal and self-evident laws of human social life.⁷⁷ In the colonial context, this philosophy often manifested in didactic binary oppositions; Heffernan outlines how the perceived ‘role reversal’ between Arab and Touareg dress – female face veiling in Arab society, versus male face veiling in Touareg society – was extrapolated to signify the absolute binarism of Arab patriarchy and Touareg Matriarchy.⁷⁸ This binary depends upon the idea that Arab cultural distinctions between public and private space, which defined female veiling practices, were comparable and exchangeable with Touareg notions of caste, nobility and respect – which defined high caste male veiling.⁷⁹ This being demonstrably untrue, it is clear that the Touareg woman plays a more rhetorical role within Duveyrier’s account as an exemplary *indigene*, an example used to covertly critique Arab culture. He continues, in *Les Touareg du Nord* (1864):

Happier than the Arab woman, the Targui woman is obliged neither to grind the wheat, nor to fetch water and wood on her back, nor to cook; slaves provide for all these needs, so that, like civilized ladies, they can devote time to reading, writing,

⁷⁶ Paul Pandolfi, ‘L’imagerie touarègue entre littérature savante et littérature populaire’ *L’Année du Maghreb*, 7 (2011) 101-113.

⁷⁷ See: Auguste Comte, *Discours sur l’ensemble du positivisme* (reissued by Cambridge University Press, 2009).

⁷⁸ Heffernan, *The Limits of Utopia*, p. 344.

⁷⁹ Assia Djebar, ‘Forbidden Gaze, Severed Sound I’ in *Women of Algiers in their Apartment*, ed. By Assia Djebar (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1992) pp. 133-151 (p. 137). Djebar assesses both earlier Orientalist attempts of unveiling and later assimilationist attempts, erotic and moralistic respectively, as a ‘stolen gaze’, attempting to use the established Maghribi public/private cultural norm to humiliate and destabilise the Algerian familial structure.

music and embroidery. *It is not without some emotion that after having crossed four hundred leagues from countries in which women have been reduced to beasts of burden, we find, in the middle of the desert, a civilization which has so much analogy with that of Christian Europe in the Middle Ages.* " ⁸⁰ (Author's emphasis)

This account, detailing what Duveyrier interprets as the elevated position of Touareg women relative (presumably) to their Arab counterparts, who have been 'reduced to beasts of burden,' plays directly into contemporary debates around assimilatory colonial policy. The 1860s marked a shift from hopes of miscegenating the indigenous familial structure, through 'the union of the daughter of the vanquished with the son of the victor,' to a more realistic aim of using indigenous women, perceived ethnographically as 'carriers' and 'reproducers' of culture, to penetrate and assimilate the indigenous family.⁸¹ Colonial penetration of the domestic space was regarded as a microcosmic penetration of indigenous society, to which practices of 'veiling' and 'cloistering' in the harem represented a physical and metaphorical barrier.⁸² Therefore, by connecting the unveiled Touareg women to a 'civilized' quotidien life of literacy, Duveyrier indirectly advocates for the 'opening' of Arab domestic spaces to assimilatory policies. In emphasizing the accessibility of the Touareg woman, and constructing their proximity to European society based on a fabled 'lost' Christian heritage – 'we recognize in [the Touareg] a woman of Christianity' – Duveyrier ultimately

⁸⁰ Original French: '*Plus heureuse que la femme arabe, la femme targuie n'est obligée ni à moudre le blé, ni à aller chercher sur son dos l'eau et le bois, ni à faire la cuisine ; les esclaves pourvoient à tous ces besoins, de sorte que, comme les dames civilisées, elles peuvent consacrer du temps à la lecture, à l'écriture, à la musique et à la broderie. Ce n'est pas sans quelque émotion, qu'après avoir traversé quatre cent lieues de pays dans lesquels la femme est réduite à l'état de bête de somme, on constate, en plein désert, une civilisation qui a tant d'analogie avec celle de l'Europe chrétienne au Moyen Âge.*' in Duveyrier, *Les Touaregs du Nord*, p. 430.

⁸¹ See: Daumas, *La femme arabe*. See also: Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, p. 66.

⁸² Julia Clancy-Smith, 'La femme Arabe: Women and Sexuality in France's North African Empire', in *Women, the Family and Divorce Laws in Islamic History*, ed. by Amira Sonbol (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1996), pp. 52-63 (p. 55).

problematizes Islam itself as a barrier to women's liberation.⁸³ This is contextualised by contemporary debates of colonial rule, wherein Algerian Jews were naturalised as French citizens by the Cremieux Decree (1870) regardless of personal status, but indigenous Muslims under the Code de l'Indigénat (1865) could only access citizenship through a renunciation of their Muslim personal status.⁸⁴ This clearly communicated that 'Islamized' indigenous peoples needed to undergo a further assimilation to French norms, primarily through an 'unveiling' of the indigenous female body in a metaphorical triumph over 'primitive promiscuities.'⁸⁵ Though the Touareg woman is appropriated to communicate this, especially in relation to *La Femme Arabe*, they were nonetheless equally excluded from citizenship based upon their personal status. Just as 'Kabylophilia' rarely amounted to any real material privilege or benefit for Kabyles compared to their more 'deviant' Arab counterparts, this elevation of Touareg women was equally immaterial.⁸⁶ This exemplifies a fundamental quality of these 'sympathetic' ethnographies; any proximity to indigenous peoples served a strictly strategic and rhetorical role, ultimately legitimating rather than undermining existing inequities of colonial privilege.

⁸³ Duveyrier, *Journal de route*, p. 164.

⁸⁴ *The Cremieux Decree*, 24th October 1870.

Senatus Consulte, 14 July 1865, and *Accompanying Regulations*, 21 April 1866 (known as le code de l'indigenat).

⁸⁵ Lorcín, *Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race*, p. 674.

Djebar, 'Forbidden Gaze, Severed Sound I,' p. 134.

⁸⁶ Lorcín, *Imperial Identities*, p. 12.

Chapter II: Recalcitrance, Punitive Ethnography, and the Reinforcement of Colonial Difference (1881 - 1911)

II.I The Flatters Expedition (1881): ‘Martyrs of geography’ and the birth of ethnographic crime

Chapter I has established that ethnographic narratives of the Touareg were based upon a colonial vulgate that arbitrarily prescribed a set of binary oppositions – Black/White, Berber/Arab, Nomadic/Sedentary, conquerors/conquered, dominant/dominated – as a type of ‘shortcut’ to understanding Sahelian and Saharan relations.⁸⁷ Any deviance or nuance to these binaries were not only overwritten, but often manipulated to continue perpetuating these binaries as a workable mode of interpretation – in the Touareg case, this manipulation served the additional purposes of reflecting the French ‘Self’ in a colonial context, and further validating the aims of assimilationist policy.⁸⁸ Inevitably, the expectations placed upon the Touareg were bound to falter; owing not only to the imaginative and often purely fictive nature of these expectations, but also that its contingency on total docility to French domination would buckle under the inherently exploitative nature of imperial expansion into the Sahara.

The Trans-Saharan expedition was commissioned in 1879 by Charles de Freycinet, minister of public works, to assess the viability of a trans-Saharan railway, led by Lieutenant-Colonel Paul Flatters. Flatters presented a dubious choice to the committee initially, whose military background imparted a ‘military imprimatur’ on the mission, thus tainting any reconnaissance information with the innate threat of political violence.⁸⁹ Flatters had a similar history as an ‘incidental’ ethnographer as many of his military contemporaries; propagating a

⁸⁷ Paul Pandolfi, ‘La Construction du myth Touareg: Quelques remarques et hypothèses,’ *Revue ethnologies comparées*, 7 (2004).

⁸⁸ Paul Pandolfi, ‘*Les Touaregs et nous*’, ‘Lointains ... et atypiques’.

⁸⁹ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, pp. 211-212.

by-now cliché narrative of Algeria as an inherently Berber land (*'La Berberie'*) with only a veneer of Arabisation and Islamisation.⁹⁰ These sets of ethnic simplifications, though certainly not unique to Flatters, fostered a sense of imperial arrogance that was a prohibitive influence on pragmatic planning for the two missions – most significantly, Flatters renounced armed escort in favour of the escort of Arab Sha'amba and Touareg guides.⁹¹ The failure of the first mission (1879-1880) as a result of a blockade by the Touareg Ajjer was an initial indication of indigenous resistance to further militaristic expansion, threatening long-standing complex networks of trans-Saharan trade.⁹² The second attempted expedition sparked an 'intricate plot to pre-empt the extension of French control,' coordinating a conjoint Touareg-Sha'amba attack on Flatters' column and ending in a brutal massacre.⁹³ The role of Touareg guides in duping Flatters into separating from several of his officers was of particular poignance, being a mission based upon the ethnographic valorisation of Touareg nobility, honesty and trust likened to a Medieval chivalric code of honour.⁹⁴ Trumbull highlights that Flatters' particular approach to the mission, as 'a military administrator to the core,' reflected how he was blindsided by a dependence not only upon Touareg 'docility,' but rigid view of Saharan peoples as only suited to a position of blind servitude.⁹⁵ In severely misestimating the extent to which the Touareg and Sha'amba, their material interests diametrically opposed to those of the expedition, were attuned to, and responded to, this colonial arrogance proved to be fatal not only for Flatters and many of those in his party, but for the myth of Touareg exceptionalism itself.

⁹⁰ See: Paul François Xavier Flatters, *Histoire de la géographies et géologie de la province de Constantine* (1865)

Silverstein, *France's Mare Nostrum*, p. 6.

⁹¹ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 213.

⁹² Amy Niang, 'The Political Economy of Ransoming in the Sahel: The History, The Ethics and the Practice,' *African Economic History*, 42 (2014) 157-183 (p. 159).

⁹³ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 214.

⁹⁴ See: Duveyrier, *Les Touareg du Nord*.

⁹⁵ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 215.

In postcolonial terms, we may interpret the Flatters Expedition as an indictment of the crude colonial vulgate which guided all colonial encounters, defined by an epistemic inability to view indigenous societies without a limiting colonial lens predicated on the superiority of the colonizer. We might refer to Chatterjee's notion of 'the rule of colonial difference' between coloniser and colonised, which still paradoxically defined efforts to 'civilise' and 'assimilate' indigenous peoples; as Rachel Nuñez astutely outlines, 'the aspiration to sameness simultaneously emphasized the existence of difference.'⁹⁶ Within colonial discourse, however, the validity of this colonial vulgate was never called into question following the disastrous Flatters expedition; instead, the notion of ethnographic criminality was applied to the Touareg to rationalise this breach of 'trust.' Trumbull defined this notion of ethnographic crime in reference to Nicholas Dirks's assessment of Criminal tribes and castes in Colonial India, wherein crime was perceived to be 'performed without agency; crime was a function of habit... an effect of caste rather than an act of will.'⁹⁷ Within this framework of culturally determined crime, ruses, trickeries and deceptions were a part of the criminal 'habit'; this is the premise under which Duveyrier's appraisals of the Touareg were subsequently reinterpreted.⁹⁸

The response to the Flatters expedition was not only contextualised by anxieties of colonial expansion, typified by the metropolitan veneration of Flatters and his ill-fated peers as 'martyrs of geography,' but also lay at crucial junctures in both Algerian political and social life, and French academic ethnography.⁹⁹ Lorcin outlines that the shift from military to civilian rule of Algeria (1871) represented a simultaneous ideological shift from 'assimilation

⁹⁶ See: Chatterjee, *The Nation and its Fragments*, and Dirks in Bernard Cohn, *Colonialism and its Forms of Knowledge*.

Rachel Nuñez, 'Rethinking Universalism: Olympe Audouard, Hubertine Auclert, and the Gender Politics of the Civilizing Mission,' *French Politics, Culture & Society*, 30:1 (2012) 23-45 (p. 25).

⁹⁷ Nicholas Dirks, *Castes of Mind: Colonialism and the Making of Modern India* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001) p. 193. cited in Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 210.

⁹⁸ Capitaine Aymard, *Les Touareg* (Paris: Librairie Hachette, 1911) p. 74.

⁹⁹ Aymard, *Les Touareg*, p. 133.

to association,' ostensibly aiming to 'civilize' through gentler processes of cooperation with indigenous institutions.¹⁰⁰ Though it theoretically offered the 'the tolerance spawned of social pluralism,' it was in reality a mournful concession to the failures of Franco-indigenous assimilation.¹⁰¹ In Lorcin's case study, the Kabyle Myth, the notion of Kabyle proximity to French civilisational rendered the Kabyle insurrection of 1871 virtually incomprehensible; resulting in violent military reprisals borne of 'savage anger' at the dissonance between French expectations and realities on the ground.¹⁰² Ethnographies of the Touareg took on a similarly punitive function; the defensiveness and vengefulness of French responses to Berber recalcitrance is comparable to Anna Marie Smith's notion of 'phantasmic reclosure' of British society following decolonisation. In a similar line of enquiry of postcolonial theorists such as Homi Bhabha, who emphasised the inherently didactic and intertextual colonizer/colonized relationship, Smith outlines that the 'rejection' of the mandate of colonial rule represented a trauma to British self-perception, leading to the defensive 'reclosure' of Britishness and the reinforcement of racialized differences – leading to the amalgamation of 'swarming' Black and brown bodies as described in fascist Enoch Powell's infamous 'Rivers of Blood' speech (1968).¹⁰³ In a similar manner, the strategic proximity of Frenchness to Kabyle and Touareg culture as a means to legitimate assimilationism was revealed to be fraught, and dealt an equally humiliating blow to French colonial self-perception.¹⁰⁴ The French colonial *raison d'être* shifted towards a notion of 'Latin Africa,' defining Algeria as a 'privileged site for the development of a new Rome to heal France's decadence.'¹⁰⁵ This new

¹⁰⁰ Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, p. 171.

¹⁰¹ Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, *ibid.*

¹⁰² Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, p. 174.

¹⁰³ Anna Marie Smith, 'Powellism: the black immigrant as the post-colonial symptom and the phantasmatic re-closure of the British nation' in *New Right discourse on race and sexuality: Britain, 1968-1990* ed. by Anna Marie Smith (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994) p. 132.

¹⁰⁴ Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, p. 181.

¹⁰⁵ Silverstein, *France's Mare Nostrum*, p. 7.

self-centred narrative alienated the need for symbolic proximity to the Touareg, from whom they were distanced on the basis of a supposed cultural criminality.

Alice Conklin argues that times of social pessimism often triggered an intense ‘problematization’ of human variability, and it is within this context of pessimism regarding colonial assimilation that the more hardline anthropological approach pioneered by Paul Broca took hold of French academic ethnography.¹⁰⁶ This polygenetic approach called into question the unity of the human race as a singular species, and subsequently fostered pessimism regarding whether certain especially ‘primitive’ races could indeed achieve civilisation.¹⁰⁷ Though not explicitly a hereditarian in emphasising ‘nature over nurture’ in human development, the rigidity of Broca’s hierarchical approach – supposedly bolstered by a newer anthropometry of human skulls – propagated fatalism about the predestination of indigenous peoples to ‘savagery.’¹⁰⁸ Coupled with the newer Brocan emphasis on racial ‘mixing’ as a degenerative influence on racial evolution, this academic development provided ethnographers with a new set of rhetorical and theoretical tools with which to punish the recalcitrant Touareg; a new conflation of race and place allowed the Touareg to be recast as a ‘poisoned fruit of the desert.’¹⁰⁹ Ostensibly, this was a total inversion of the works of Duveyrier; however, a common thread we can observe is the continuation of a deeply moralistic and essentialist ethnography, using the Touareg not as a ‘true’ ethnographic subject, but as a vessel to articulate contemporary anxieties of colonial rule.

II.II Post-Flatters Ethnographies: Problematizing the failures of Franco-Indigenous assimilation

¹⁰⁶ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, p. 24.

¹⁰⁷ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, p. 43.

¹⁰⁸ Staum, *Nature and Nurture*, p. 492.

¹⁰⁹ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 212.

An indication of the reactive nature of ethnographies of the Touareg following the Flatters disaster was its purely cultural focus; a narrative of cultural, rather than racial, criminality allowed ethnographers to articulate their frustrations with the Touareg without totally discounting the works of Daumas and Duveyrier. Though some allusions to Duveyrier's romantic naivety were made, a total indictment of his influential work would have amounted to an attack on colonial discourse itself; as an effective workaround, trickery and deception was embedded in this newer notion of cultural criminality, thus explaining away Duveyrier's 'misconceptions.'¹¹⁰ G.D. Bédier, a French lawyer deriving his apparent authority on the Touareg from his 'member[ship] of several scholarly societies,' frames Touareg insurgency as a type of cultural politics of refusal, driven by a 'secret determination' for a total monopoly on Saharan and Sahelian economies.¹¹¹ Claiming to have uncovered this 'secret power' 'which no one has ever thought of,' Bédier's *Le Sahara-Niger, ou, Transaharien* (1888) outlines how this innately cultural arrogance causes the Touareg 'stop at nothing: armed attacks, cunning, treachery, poison, betrayal, everything – so much importance they attached to this supreme condition of their domination in the Sahara.'¹¹² The bitterness at Touareg self-defence from French expansion is palpable, even making direct reference to Flatters and his companions as a 'glorious memory.'¹¹³ Bédier's focus on the conspiratorial element of Touareg 'power' certainly validates Trumbull's comparison of cultural criminality to British notions of conspiratorial 'castes.'¹¹⁴ As T. Lloyd outlines, in organising nomadic 'jangali' castes into a narrative of a trans-Indian 'Thuggee' conspiracy of caste-based criminality, the resistance of these groups to burgeoning British dominance and

¹¹⁰ See: G-D Bédier, *Le Sahara-Niger, ou Transsaharien: Conférence faite à Paris devant le Comité de l'Afrique du Nord* (Paris: Challamel & Co, 1888) and Aymard, *Les Touareg*.

¹¹¹ Bédier, *Le Sahara-Niger*, p. 7.

¹¹² Original French: *Cependant, pour arriver à leur fin, les Touaregs ne reculèrent devant rien: attaques à main armée, ruse, perfidie, poison, trahison, tout, tant ils attachèrent et attachent d'importance à cette condition suprême de leur domination dans le Sahara.* in Bédier, *Le Sahara-Niger*, p. 9.

¹¹³ Bédier, *Le Sahara-Niger*, *ibid*.

¹¹⁴ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 210.

privatisation of traditionally nomadic lands could be framed as a cultural deficiency as opposed to a reflection of British injustice.¹¹⁵ In a similar manoeuvre, Bédier's account uses the notion of Touareg criminality to deflect from the weakening of the French mandate in the Sahara that the Flatters attack represented.

Bédier's critique of the Touareg was cloaked in the familiar rhetoric of Oriental despotism that was first used in the Algerian context to critique the 'stagnant despotism' of Ottoman rule.¹¹⁶ Bédier appeals to this colonial archetype of the 'despot' by describing the Touareg in terms of their singular thirst for power, a feature of 'political immaturity' that covertly calls into question their ability to be 'civilized' under a French societal model.¹¹⁷ Invoking the omnipresent dichotomy of French rationality/Indigenous irrationality, Bédier connects this to a rare reference to Touareg Islamic fanaticism:

*No Touareg has ever revealed to a living soul this secret which made and kept their power. All are equally determined to not reveal it. It has even become a sacred and inviolable dogma for these fanatics, who always end up attaching a religious meaning to all that is of some importance in their conduct.*¹¹⁸ (Author's emphasis)

This notion of the total impenetrability of the Touareg, hiding their supposed 'secret' desire for Saharan domination, is reminiscent of the contemporary French debates surrounding Islam, female emancipation, and veiling. Feminists such as Hubertine Auclert singled out the supposed cloistering of Muslim women behind 'cages, walled homes' and veils as a barrier to their assimilation and hypothetical future suffrage; Daumas similarly singled out veiling and 'cloistering' as a protective influence around deviant Muslim sexual

¹¹⁵ T. Lloyd, 'Thuggee, Marginality and the State Effect in Colonial India, circa 1770–1840', *Indian Economic and Social Review*, 45:2 (2008) 201-237 (p. 232).

¹¹⁶ Jennifer Pitts, 'Tocqueville and the Algeria Question,' in *A Turn to Empire: The Rise of Imperial Liberalism in Britain and France* ed. by Jennifer Pitts (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009) p. 207.

¹¹⁷ Pitts, 'Tocqueville and the Algeria Question,' *ibid.*

¹¹⁸ Bédier, *Le Sahara-Niger*, p. 8

mores.¹¹⁹ It appears no coincidence that this contemporary problematisation of the ‘secrecy’ of Islam appears in Bédier’s account; by reconfiguring the Touareg as Muslim, a rich historical connection in the colonial imaginary between Islam and supposed cultural ‘savagery’ could be drawn upon to ethnographically ‘punish’ them.¹²⁰ Even in less reactionary accounts, such as Henri Bissuel’s *Le Sahara français* (1891), the genealogical and religious rationales for Touareg ‘Whiteness’ propagated by Périer and Duveyrier were dispensed with in a manner that amounted to mere subtext; one may speculate that Bissuel assumed that the shift in the discourse regarding the Touareg was so ubiquitous amongst his scholarly readership that the abandonment of these theories warranted little explanation.¹²¹ Bissuel’s ethnographic ‘punishment’ was not the mere reinforcement of Touareg Islam, but emphasising its superstitious nature as an example of civilisational backwardness:

*Medicine is unknown among the Touareg: for certain diseases they have strange remedies that tradition has passed on to them, and that they employ with the belief that if the patient is not cured, God did not will it or that the Djenouns [spirits] got in the way.*¹²²

Trumbull notes that French ethnographic writing in the late nineteenth century deliberately emphasised ‘Islam’s ritualized, magical, and superstitious elements’ as a means to renew vigour for a secular *mission civilisatrice*.¹²³ Returning to Nuñez notion that the ‘aspiration to sameness’ nonetheless ‘emphasised difference,’ Bissuel uses an arbitrary

¹¹⁹ Clancy-Smith, *La femme Arabe*, pp. 60-61.

¹²⁰ See: de Tocqueville, *Essay on Algeria*.

¹²¹ Original French: ‘Quelle était leur religion primitive? La croix qu’on retrouve dans leurs dessins d’ornementation et dans plusieurs parties de leur équipement (pommeau de la selle, poignées des sabres et poignards) peut faire supposer qu’ils ont été Chrétiens : cette opinion, longtemps admise, est aujourd’hui contestée, bien qu’elle n’ait rien d’invraisemblable.’ in Henri Bissuel, *Le Sahara français: conférence sur les questions sahariennes* (Alger: Jourdan, 1891) p. 145.

¹²² Original French: ‘La médecine est inconnue chez les Touareg : pour certaines maladies, ils ont des remèdes plus ou moins étranges que la tradition leur a transmis et qu’ils emploient avec la conviction que, si le malade ne guérit pas, c’est que Dieu ne l’a pas permis ou que les Djenoun.’ in Bissuel, *Le Sahara français*, p. 164.

¹²³ Trumbull, *An Empire of Facts*, pp. 93–146.

dichotomy between religious mysticism and scientific knowledge to demonstrate this difference.¹²⁴ Representing a significant deviation from Périér's previous assertion of the Touareg affinity for 'scientific thinking,' this new emphasis on the 'strangeness' of Touareg rituals serves a punitive ethnographic function in alienating the Touareg from the esteem of 'rationality' and civilisational 'intelligence' they had previously been endowed with.¹²⁵

Trumbull argues that the notion of the innate criminality of the Touareg was largely a foregone conclusion; 'it appears as a kind of generalising machine, transforming the raw material of the death of the explorer into statements of culpability [...] and finally [an] end product of large-scale cultural generalisations.'¹²⁶ Therefore, the use of incidental ethnographic information to validate these conclusions could, in fact, contradict each other. Whereas for Bédier, the Touareg 'exclusivity of race' – once lauded by Daumas, Duveyrier and Périér as an indication of prestigious racial pedigree – indicated the deliberate preservation and perpetuation of a criminal caste; by contrast, for Capitaine Leopold Aymard in *Les Touareg* (1911), racial miscegenation between the Touareg and other Sahelian groups had supposedly brought forth 'the primitive strain.'¹²⁷ Whilst neither of these hypotheses can be simultaneously true, it demonstrates the extent to which ethnographic 'features' were merely a vessel for a conclusion that had already been made in the cultural discourse – that of Touareg delinquency. Aymard distinguished himself by making a first attempt to racialize this myth, concluding that the Touareg 'physiognomy' reflects 'carelessness and often cunning.'¹²⁸ By the time of Aymard's study, anthropology was dominated by the neo-Lamarckian 'idea of a fixed human nature with the possibility of adaptation to a milieu and

¹²⁴ Nuñez, *Rethinking Universalism*, *ibid.*

¹²⁵ See: Périér, 'Des races dites berbères et de leur ethnogénie.'

¹²⁶ Trumbull, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 256.

¹²⁷ Aymard, *Les Touareg*, pp. 8-9.

¹²⁸ Aymard, *Les Touareg*, pp. 74-75.

transmissible acquired characteristics.’¹²⁹ Taking this ‘synergistic’ approach to the perennial nature/nurture dichotomy, Aymard transposes the fixity of Touareg ‘cunning’ onto their facial characteristics, and bolsters this same idea by designating the influence of the ‘climate,’ ‘kind of existence’ (read: nomadic) and the ‘new mores that were the consequence’ as a further determiner of Touareg ‘audacity’ and criminality.¹³⁰ This conflation of race, place and climate, whilst framed as a holistic analysis of both heredity and cultural-environmental milieu, served as a potent rationale for further penetration of French influence in the Sahara. Diana Davis explores the parallel between colonial narratives of desertification in Algeria and narratives of anti-nomadism, predicated on the idea that desert ‘wastelands’ were a direct product of unproductive and ‘ignorant’ practices of nomadic pastoralism.¹³¹ Propositions of reforestation were often coupled with propositions of sedentarisation policy, creating a powerful conflation of geography and indigeneity in an attempt to make both ‘productive’ under French colonial domination.¹³² Ethnographer Ernest Mercier solidifies this conflation of race and place in terms of criminality; ‘in reality, the Sahara is just a huge death-trap, where violence reigns without question, where betrayal is the only law.’¹³³ Conklin’s notion of the causal relationship between social pessimism and the ‘problematization’ of colonized

¹²⁹ Staum, *Nature and Nurture*, p. 477.

¹³⁰ Original French: ‘*De plus, sous l’influence du climat, du genre d’existence, des nouvelles mœurs qui en furent la conséquence, les caractères physiques des individus se transformèrent profondément, obéissant plus ou moins aux règles de l’évolution, ou transformation lente de Lamarck, si bien que le type actuel de la race ressemble fort peu à celui de l’ancêtre primitif.*’ in Aymard, *Les Touareg*, pp. 8-9.

Original French: ‘*L’existence agitée que mènent les Touareg, les luttes continues qu’ils se livrent entre eux, les pillages qu’ils commettent sans cesse aux dépens des Songhays, des Maures, de leurs congénères et même des Européens, ont énormément contribué à développer leur audace.*’ in Aymard, *Les Touareg*, pp. 79-80.

¹³¹ Diana K. Davis, ‘Desert ‘wastes’ of the Maghreb: desertification narratives in French colonial environmental history of North Africa,’ *Cultural Geographies*, 11:4 (2004) 359-387 (p. 366).

¹³² Davis, *Desert ‘wastes’ of the Maghreb*, p. 367.

¹³³ Original French: ‘*En réalité, le Sahara n’est qu’un vaste coupe-gorge, où la violence règne sans conteste, où la trahison est la seule loi. Depuis bien longtemps, sans doute, la situation n’y a été aussi déplorable, surtout pour nous, Français, parce que les crimes les plus odieux ont été encouragés par la plus complète impunité.*’ in Ernest Mercier, *La France dans le Sahara et au Soudan* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1889) p. 31.

‘races’ is made abundantly evident here; the martyrdom of Flatters had directly sparked the problematization of ethnographic criminal conspiracies, environmental hazard and ‘waste,’ and deficiencies in French legal jurisprudence.¹³⁴ These insecurities of Colonial rule were applied punitively to the Touareg through ethnography, which Trumbull asserts as the ‘preferred mode’ of reinstating and perpetuating France’s ‘monopoly on judicial violence.’¹³⁵

Though Trumbull’s assessment of the punitive nature of post-Flatters ethnographies of the Touareg has been largely validated here, it perhaps relies on a narrow reading of the contemporary literature. Lieutenant Emile Hourst’s *Sur le Niger et au pays des Touaregs* (1898) comprises a surprising reproduction of key facets of Duveyrier’s appraisal of the Touareg, alongside a sense of optimism that the ‘race will be civilised,’ which was far more indicative of earlier assimilationist aspirations than its actual turn of the century context of Franco-indigenous ‘association.’¹³⁶ His only reservation was, in fact, far less reactive to the Flatters affair that Trumbull’s somewhat narrow reading would imply:

‘And yet I have a thought: for the Tuaregs, will [civilisation] be good? When I imagine their wandering life, free from all hindrance, their world where courage is the first virtue, where people are almost equal with equal qualities, I wonder if they are not happier than us. [...] Wild customs, but at least heroic and proud feelings. In their transformation, what will the Touareg gain? The sons of those of today will be citizens. Nothing will remind them of the ancient knights of the desert. They will no longer go to war, in raid against the neighbouring tribes, they will no longer plunder, it will be said. But perhaps also, in a Stock Exchange which will replace the tent of the amenokal, they will try to launch shady businesses, problematic mines. What will

¹³⁴ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, pp. 23-24.

¹³⁵ Trumbull, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 254.

¹³⁶ Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, p. 171.

they be then? Thieves. *Definitely, I prefer my plunderers: Imochar which is free, free like the lion.*' ¹³⁷

Hourst comes surprisingly close to mounting a critique of the self-evident validity of universalism that defined the *mission civilisatrice*. Hall argues that this lamentation was a recognition of the 'Faustian bargain' that intimacy and proximity to the Touareg represented; certainly, the Flatters expedition exemplified a sense of damage to white self-esteem, having demonstrated a degree of vulnerability in aligning themselves with indigeneity.¹³⁸ One could argue that Hourst's anxiety about the Touareg becoming 'thieves' under a French model of citizenship also represented an inverted 'Faustian bargain' for the Touareg, a rare concession that aspirations to 'sameness' inherently overwrote and dismissed indigenous epistemologies and cultural specificities. Ultimately, Hourst's dissent from his more punitive contemporaries illustrate the broader cultural shifts that the 'death' of Touareg exceptionalism also represented; namely, that abandoning the earlier colonial rationale of assimilation represented a mournful admission of failure for the completion of the *mission civilisatrice*.

II.III 'Les Touaregs à Paris': Decontextualisation, essentialism and punitive ethnographic display

¹³⁷ Original French: '*La race se civilisera; ses défauts, qui dérivent tous de la violence, disparaîtront : la société moderne aura conquis un nouveau terrain en Afrique [...] Et pourtant il me vient une réflexion: pour les Touaregs, sera-ce un bien ? Quand j'imagine leur vie errante, libre de toute entrave, leur monde où le courage est la première des vertus, où les gens sont presque égaux à qualités égales, je me demande s'ils ne sont pas plus heureux que nous. [...] Mœurs sauvages, mais du moins sentiments héroïques et fiers. A leur transformation que gagnera le Touareg ? Les fils de ceux d'aujourd'hui seront des citoyens. Rien ne rappellera plus en eux les anciens chevaliers du désert. Ils ne partiront plus en guerre, en razzis contre les tribus voisines, ils ne pilleront plus, dira-t-on. Mais peut-être aussi, dans une Bourse qui remplacera la tente de l'amenokal, essayeront-ils de lancer des affaires véreuses, des mines problématiques. Que seront-ils alors ? Des voleurs. Décidément, j'aime mieux mes pillards : Imochar qui est libre, libre comme le lion*' in Emile Hourst, *Sur le Niger et au pays des Touaregs : la mission Hourst, par le lieutenant de vaisseau Hourst* (Paris: Librairie Plon, 1898) pp. 235-236.

¹³⁸ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, p. 129.

Ethnographic display of colonial artefacts could serve a multitude of functions, often guided by the prevailing anthropological expertise of the époque; whether through ‘jumbled’ curiosity cabinets or systematized gradations of material culture designed to represent a racial ‘evolutionary trajectory,’ exhibiting indigeneity often took a punitive and normative role.¹³⁹ Just as Trumbull asserts that ethnographic studies could be used to ‘discipline’ recalcitrant groups, Conklin asserts that ethnographic public display could similarly put indigenous bodies on ‘stage,’ invoking the Foucauldian notion of the discipline of ‘delinquent’ criminal bodies through hyper surveillance in the modern prison.¹⁴⁰ Putting the ethnographic artefact on display in Metropolitan France also served the function of total decontextualisation of ethnographic knowledge; like a ‘photograph viewed too close up,’ this decontextualisation created a spectacle of the bizarre, functionless ‘colonial picturesque’ to quench metropolitan appetites for the consumption of the ‘out-there-ness’ of the colonial Orient.¹⁴¹

In a sense, Lieutenant Hourst’s anxieties about the Touareg being viewed poorly when transposed into a metropolitan French context were made manifest in the exhibition ‘*Les Touaregs du Sahara*’ (1907) at the Colonial Garden, Paris, Nogent-sur-Marne, and Paul Atgier’s ‘*Les Touaregs à Paris*’ installation (1909) which ‘recreated’ a Touareg camp ‘at the corner of rue Blanche and boulevard de Clichy.’¹⁴² The promotional material for *Les Touaregs du Sahara* drew upon the aesthetics of the ‘noble savage’ archetype, appealing to the association of the Touareg to the stereotype in popular novels and travelogues of the

¹³⁹ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, p. 8.

See also: Tony Bennett, ‘The Exhibitionary Complex,’ *New Formations* 4:1 (1998) 73-102.

¹⁴⁰ See: Foucault, *Discipline and Punish*.

¹⁴¹ David Prochaska, ‘The Archive of *Algérie Imaginaire*,’ *History & Anthropology* 4:2 (1990), 373-420 (p. 406).

¹⁴² Paul Atgier, ‘*Les Touaregs à Paris*,’ *Bulletins et Mémoires de la Société d'Anthropologie de Paris*, 10 (1909) 222-243 (p. 222).

epoque (Figure I).¹⁴³ Though still tinged with a Duveyrian romanticism of Touareg ‘nobility,’ these popular depictions retained the fundamental ‘Otherness’ and exoticism of the Touareg, forming a type of ‘colonial picturesque’ wherein the combination of primitivism and ‘nobility’ represented a nostalgic articulation of a ‘lost’ premodern French heritage. The 1907 exhibition provided an opportunity for French spectators to engage sensorially in this nostalgia; Figure II shows a life size model of a Touareg warrior, often the archetypal image of noble savagery in popular colonial novels.¹⁴⁴ This image encapsulates the dual processes of decontextualisation and depersonalisation that defined the exhibition. By placing a ‘veiled warrior’ within a Parisian exhibition hall, surrounded by framed botanical illustrations, the veil is dislocated from both its environmental and cultural functions; rendered a total oddity within this new context, it is therefore a mere spectacle of ethnic difference.¹⁴⁵ The use of a model allowed for selectivity and creative licence, creating an essentialised version of a Touareg ‘type’ onto which the French imagination of ‘savagery’ could be transposed. Classen and Howes delineate how the Colonial museum offered a new realm for the white viewer to engage in a sensorial consumption of the Orient; it offered a discreet space for curious French spectators to engage in the ‘lower senses’ ordinarily associated with the ‘lower species’ (read: colonized subjects).¹⁴⁶ By literally depersonalizing the Touareg body, visitors could experience this primitive ‘sensescape’ without having to recognise the personhood (and agency) of the ethnographic subject.¹⁴⁷ Therefore, a new type of relationship between the colonial Self and Other is established, and a new realm of proximity established; a French spectator at the 1907 exhibition could now use Touareg bodies to articulate their own

¹⁴³ Paul Pandolfi, ‘Imaginaire colonial et littérature: Jules Verne chez les Touaregs,’ *Revue ethnologies comparées*, 5 (2002).

¹⁴⁴ See, for example: G. Demage, *À travers le Sahara* (Paris: Hachette, 1903).

¹⁴⁵ Prochaska, *The Archive of Algérie Imaginaire*, p. 382.

¹⁴⁶ Constance Classen and David Howes, ‘The Museum as Sensescape: Western Sensibilities and Indigenous Artefacts’ in *Sensible Objects : Colonialism, Museums and Material Culture*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards, et al., (Bloomsbury Publishing, 2006) pp. 199-222 (p. 199)

¹⁴⁷ Classen and Howes, *The Museum as Sensescape* p. 206.

nostalgia for a primitive ‘state of nature,’ without compromising the sense of colonial difference (represented by the personhood of the viewer juxtaposed against depersonalisation of the Touareg body) that now resolutely defined French approaches to Algeria’s *indigènes*.¹⁴⁸

The use of real Touareg subjects to stage a ‘living’ ethnographic exhibition in Atgier’s *Les Touaregs à Paris* (1909) employed similar processes of decontextualisation in staging a performance of the colonial picturesque. In constructing a ‘Saharan Oasis’ on the streets of Paris, once again Touareg culture is rendered a meaningless spectacle of ‘Otherness,’ memorialised in *cartes postales* (Figures III-X) wherein the vacant stares of the subjects seem to hint at the hegemonic and exploitative nature of the camera lens, and by extension, the colonial lens.¹⁴⁹ These images take on a more sinister meaning when read in conjunction with Atgier’s ethnographic report to the *Société d'Anthropologie de Paris* (1909), which gleans the punitive nature of the exhibition. Atgier’s most powerful rhetorical tool against the Touareg was the weaponization of Blackness; one rare theoretical constant in the French academic shift from ethnology to racial anthropology was the role of Blackness as the ‘basest’ and most ‘primitive’ racial type.¹⁵⁰ Atgier foregrounds his craniological study by invoking a familiar discourse around veiling:

*It was then impossible for us to be able to study the features of their physiognomy which they jealously hid from the eyes of all, keeping themselves completely veiled, except at eye level [...] this custom [has] become almost religious among them.*¹⁵¹

¹⁴⁸ See: Barbara Arneil, ‘John Locke, Natural Law and Colonialism,’ *History of Political Thought*, 13:4 (1992) 587-603.

¹⁴⁹ Prochaska, ‘The Archive of *Algérie Imaginaire*’ p. 407.

¹⁵⁰ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, pp. 110-111.

¹⁵¹ Original French: ‘*Il nous avait alors été impossible de pouvoir étudier les traits de leur physionomie qu’ils cachaient jalousement aux yeux de tous, la conservant voilée complètement, sauf au niveau des yeux que l’on voyait étinceler dans un mince intervalle de leur voile de figure. Cette coutume devenue pour ainsi dire religieuse chez eux.*’ in Atgier, *Les Touaregs à Paris*, p. 223.

In an allusion to Bedier's notion of Touareg 'secrecy' as an indication of cultural criminality, Atgier uses the powerful metaphor of unveiling as a mode of 'conquering knowledge' to reveal the apparently 'negrified' nature of Touareg culture as a whole.¹⁵² Revealing that even the most 'Caucasian' types have some 'traces of negro mixing' – using Brocan anthropometric techniques 'by means of the height rod, slide compass, thickness compass, chromatic scale of eyes, skin and hair colour chart' to produce pejorative images of Touareg blackness, and 'a fierce and barbaric physiognomy.'¹⁵³ Though in postcolonial terms, the notion that facial features can glean a 'fierce and barbaric' racial character is a purely pseudoscientific phantasm, Atgier deliberately plays into contemporary fears of *metisage* (racial mixing) as having a destabilising effect on positivist racial hierarchies.¹⁵⁴ Furthermore, he admits to misrepresenting the Touareg by excluding the 'noble caste' from the exhibition; 'in fact, the Touareg of noble race *would not have consented* to such an exhibition.'¹⁵⁵ The punitive nature of Atgier's exhibition is laid bare; in using almost exclusively black bodies to play into the 'savage' nature of Blackness in the colonial imaginary, the Touareg are definitely pushed to the opposite end of the Black-White polarity by which all European racial thinking was defined.

In light of this, returning to the *cartes postales* – particularly the rituals and dances in Figures IV-VI – reveals what Malek Alloua calls 'ventriloquist art.' The manipulation of performing indigenous bodies represents the peak of Foucault's notion of modern violence; through the ubiquity of colonial surveillance and the implicit threat of political violence, these Touareg are coerced into inflicting their own ethnographic punishment onto themselves

¹⁵² See: Lindsey Moore, 'Darkly as through a veil': reading representations of Algerian women,' *Intercultural Education*, 18:4 (2007) 335-351.

See also: Cohn, *Colonialism and Its Forms of Knowledge*.

¹⁵³ Atgier, *Les Touaregs à Paris*, p. 239.

¹⁵⁴ Conklin, *In the Museum of Man*, p. 46.

¹⁵⁵ Atgier, *Les Touaregs à Paris*, pp. 241-242.

through staging pejorative colonial tropes.¹⁵⁶ To Allaoua, the commodification and mass production of these ‘aesthetic justification[s] of colonial violence’ represented a final step in the exertion of colonial epistemic power.¹⁵⁷ Through these processes of erasing indigenous agency, decontextualising and accentuating cultural ‘difference,’ and finally, coercing indigenous bodies to ‘stage’ colonial racism, Franz Fanon argues that the normative colonial gaze is necessarily internalised, perpetuating colonial racism on an individual and psychological level.¹⁵⁸ This invokes the fundamental postcolonial question that will be explored in Chapter III: to what extent does this mechanism of epistemic dominance extend beyond colonialism proper?

¹⁵⁶ Malek Allaoua, *Le Harem Colonial: Images d'un sous-érotisme* (Seguier: Paris, 2001) pp. 86-87.

¹⁵⁷ Allaoua, *Le Harem Coloniale*, *ibid.*

¹⁵⁸ See: Frantz Fanon, *Black Skin, White Masks* (London: Pluto Press, 1986)

CHAPTER III: Postcoloniality and Knowledge: Reproductions and subversions of ethnic difference in Touareg and Amazigh political consciousness

III.I Amazigh Political Consciousness in the Postcolonial Nation: A return to the 'Triangular' relationship?

The previous chapters have outlined the role of 'soft' colonial power, namely ethnographic enquiry, in creating a monopoly on knowledge which ultimately served to rationalise, legitimate, and reproduce inequitable colonial dynamics. This truly represented, to use Bernard Cohn's phrasing, a 'conquest of knowledge;' the colonial erasure, eradication and rearticulation of indigenous epistemologies served to monopolise knowledge *itself*, creating a Foucauldian circular 'knowledge-power' relation that perpetually legitimated colonial rule.¹⁵⁹ This monopoly, to postcolonial theorists such as Spivak, resulted in an inability for indigenous actors to 'speak;' speaking, here, used in the Foucauldian sense of being able to 'speak' so as to be heard, interpreted and allowed to contribute to a broader cultural discourse.¹⁶⁰ In the case of the Touareg, we have delineated how elements of their social and cultural life were *necessarily* transfigured through a lens of French colonial epistemology – their cultural concept of honour is branded 'feudal,' or their religious complexities deemed 'essentially' Christian – in order to contribute to the discourse of academic ethnographic knowledge.

As Chapter II explored, the dominance of French colonial epistemology was not just reflected in inaccurate or pejorative ethnographies, but could go further in coercing indigenous bodies to 'perform' Orientalist phantasms – with an implicit aim to highlight the

¹⁵⁹ See: Cohn, *Colonialism and its forms of knowledge*.

Michel Foucault, *The Will to Knowledge: The History of Sexuality Volume 1* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978) (trans. Robert Hurley) p. 139.

¹⁶⁰ Michel Foucault, *The Archeology of Knowledge and the Discourse on Language* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972) p. 25.

Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, 'Can the Subaltern Speak? Speculations on Widow Sacrifice', *Wedge*, (1985) 120-130 (p. 120 & p. 129).

‘deviancy’ of indigenous cultures, and with a view to impart a binary of ‘respectability’ and ‘savagery’ in the indigenous psyche as a self-corrective form of colonial discipline.¹⁶¹

Martiniquan postcolonial theorist Franz Fanon explores this concept in *Black Skin, White Masks* (1967), arguing that the psychological internalisation of the ‘gaze’ of white respectability forces the colonized individual to adopt a dual self perception; the first being their ‘indigenous’ self, and the other being the critical gaze of colonial racial politics.¹⁶² This results in psychological and social dissonance, as well as an epistemic difficulty in articulating one’s identity without this introspective white ‘gaze;’ Spivak concludes, somewhat pessimistically, that the Subaltern cannot truly ‘speak’ without a radical deconstruction of these colonial histories of epistemic violence.¹⁶³

This radical deconstruction was pioneered by the Subaltern Studies group; a critical starting point for this endeavour was a deconstruction of colonial policing of what ‘types’ of knowledge held innate value.¹⁶⁴ To use the Touareg as an example, cultural knowledge of the group was only deemed ‘valid’ after examination and reformulation by exclusively white male actors, with processes of selection and distortion aiming to highlight aspects that were pertinent to whichever societal and academic debates held sway at the time. This has contributed to a trope that so-called ‘Third World’ or ‘Global South’ cultures are only capable of producing ‘data’ – but not ‘theory [...] paradigms of explanation, [or] epistemology.’¹⁶⁵ To redress this epistemic inequality, which is indisputably inherited from colonial processes of knowledge construction, this chapter will explore not only the ‘paradigms of explanation’ developed within the Amazigh political movement, but also less ‘formal’ forms of knowledge. Under the colonial epistemic lens, music, poetry, rituals and

¹⁶¹ See: Foucault, *Discipline and Punish*.

¹⁶² Frantz Fanon, *Black Skin, White Masks* (London: Pluto Press, 1986)

¹⁶³ Spivak, *Can the Subaltern Speak?* p. 76.

¹⁶⁴ See Arondekar on types of knowledge in the colonial archive: Anjali Arondekar, ‘Without a Trace: Sexuality and the Colonial Archive’, *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, 14:½ (2005) 10-27.

¹⁶⁵ Raewyn Connell, ‘Rethinking Gender from the South’, *Feminist Studies*, 40:3 (2014) 518-539 (p. 520).

oral histories were ‘disqualified as inadequate to [its] task’ of being knowledge; in exploring the self-described ‘poet-guitarists and soul rebels’ Tinariwen, this Chapter aims to uncover a more cohesive and ‘decolonial’ history of Touareg responses to colonial ethnographic myths.¹⁶⁶

The process of modern nation-building was a direct inheritance of decolonization; the indigenous peoples of the French Soudan (Independent Mali in 1960) and French Algeria (Independent Algeria in 1962), having been problematized and examined as racialized subjects under the colonial regime, now suddenly found themselves extending a similar problematization of variability to their new co-citizens. Benedict Anderson outlines how constructing a national community is an essentially ‘imaginative’ process, representing a novel form of human relation in extending a singular, cohesive narrative of identity to wide swathes of socially, geo-historically and materially heterogeneous peoples.¹⁶⁷ Often, processes of essentializing and historicising a particularly dominant identity, whether ethno-religious or political, took place; inevitably, this created a set of implicit ‘others’ and ‘outliers’ to whom national identity was only nominally applied.¹⁶⁸ The Touareg posed a particular problem to this process; their porous and itinerant territorial boundaries, by 1962, encroached on no less than five sovereign nations; Libya, Algeria, Niger, Mali and Burkina Faso. Anthropologist Ines Kohl argues that this problematic citizenship of the Touareg is exemplified in the etymology of the word *ishumar*, referring to Touareg society as a whole. Deriving from the French word *chômage*, meaning ‘unemployment,’ and initially referring to Touareg economic migrants to urban centres, it has since evolved to mean ‘borderliners’–

¹⁶⁶ Spivak, ‘Can the Subaltern Speak?’ p.76.

¹⁶⁷ Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, p. 11.

¹⁶⁸ Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, *ibid.*

signifying a destabilizing, porous transnational identity that undermines the fundamental unifying goals of the nation-state project.¹⁶⁹

Hall argues that the longevity of the myth of Touareg exceptionalism, always articulated through either European-Touareg-Arab or European-Touareg-Black gradations of supposed ‘civility,’ is due to its deeply racialised origins.¹⁷⁰ The notion of irreconcilable and primordial racial difference was a further destabilising influence on construction of a singular national identity. The Algerian Front Liberation Nationale’s model of Algerian nationhood was predicated on a ‘natural Arab-Islamic framework’ from its very inception; though this nominally included the Touareg as Muslims, this inclusion was made precarious by previous ethnographic insistence of the Christian ‘essence’ of Touareg society.¹⁷¹ In contrast, the Malian model of statehood was specifically drawn from Mande social thought – specifically, the Mande concept of *faso*, meaning ‘nation’ or ‘father’s home’ – thus casting the nomadic, matriarchal Touareg as culturally incompatible with dominant notions of statehood.¹⁷² Though both models were decidedly ethnocentric, the ways in which these new models of citizenship impacted the lived realities of the Touareg were drastically different. Martin Evans and John Phillips delineate how the FLN’s Arabization policy was as much based upon a fear of French neo-colonial cultural encroachment as it was an exclusion of Berber languages and customs.¹⁷³ Therefore, Arabisation was not aimed at actively erasing Berber or

¹⁶⁹ Ines Kohl, ‘Modern Nomads, Vagabonds, or Cosmopolitans? Reflections on Contemporary Touareg Society’ *Journal of Anthropological Research*, 66:4 (2010) 449-462 (p. 450).

¹⁷⁰ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, p. 129.

¹⁷¹ National Liberation Front, ‘Proclamation, November 1, 1954.’

Paul Pandolfi, ‘L’imagerie touarègue entre littérature savante et littérature populaire’ *L’Année du Maghreb*, 7 (2011) 101-113.

¹⁷² Ryan Thomas Skinner, ‘Cultural Politics in the Post-Colony: Music, Nationalism and Statism in Mali, 1964-75’ *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, 82:4 (2012), 511-534 (p. 513).

¹⁷³ Martin Evans and John Phillips, ‘Darling of the Non-Aligned Movement, 1962–78’ in *Anger of the Dispossessed* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007) p. 87.

Touareg culture in its entirety, but rather took the form of creating a ubiquity of the Arabic language within education, the press and administrative and bureaucratic settings.¹⁷⁴

By contrast, the Mande-dominated postcolonial Malian government viewed nomadism itself as a barrier to their modernizing and industrializing national aims. Baz Lecqoq explains:

*The new Malian administration was determined to solve 'the nomad problem'. Believing in modern technique, rational production, socialism, and, above all, the malleability of the human condition, the new regime was determined to put the Sahara to use and civilise its population. The regime was convinced that agriculture was possible in the Sahara; that the Kel Tamasheq could and should be sedentarised and educated; and that they should take up farming and ranching, instead of wandering around and counting their heads of cattle.'*¹⁷⁵

Seemingly reiterating the colonial geographical myth of desertification as a direct result of mismanagement by civilisationally 'backwards' groups, this conflation of race and place led to forced sedentarisation policies that amounted to a direct rejection of Touareg socio-economic life as an operative mode of being a Malian citizen.¹⁷⁶ This policy was a direct factor in the first Touareg revolt (1962-64) against the central state. This is a potent example of how the construction of ethnic incompatibility – serving a fleeting function in the early colonial period as a rationale for French primordialism – can permeate deeply into postcolonial dynamics, resulting in aggressive political policies and subsequent insurgencies that, in turn, legitimate and feed the 'vicious circle' of ethnic strife. These modernization

¹⁷⁴ Ali Alalou, 'Language and Ideology in the Maghreb: Francophonie and Other Languages,' *French Review*, 80:2 (2006) 408-421.

¹⁷⁵ Baz Lecocq, *Disputed Desert: Decolonisation, Competing Nationalisms and Tuareg Rebellions in Northern Mali* (Brill, 2010) p. 131.

¹⁷⁶ Lecocq, *Disputed Desert*, 131-135.

policies aimed at erasing key aspects of Touareg cultural life were eventually conceptualised in Touareg popular memory as a form of ‘recolonisation.’¹⁷⁷

The disparity between the Algerian approach of erasure of ethnic difference and Arabisation, and the Malian approach of othering and reinforcing Touareg incompatibility with citizenship, whilst not explanatory in themselves, can inform our understanding of the difference in Algerian and Malian Touareg political resistance. The successive Touareg rebellions against the Malian state (1962-1964, 1990–1995, 2007- 2009, 2012), although mostly low-intensity conflicts, appear to reproduce this notion of incompatibility within a Mande ethnocentric model of citizenship. By contrast, Touareg resistance in the Algerian context have taken the form of political activism within the Amazigh political movement, propagated by transnational publications such as *Amazigh Voice*, largely seeking to fight the erasure of Amazigh identity and for its inclusion within a more pluralistic notion of Algerian national identity.¹⁷⁸

Whilst it is essential to delineate how processes of essentialism and otherisation inherited from colonial thinking manifest in real material and political marginality in the postcolonial era, allowing this to form a rigid narrative of Touareg subjectivity erases the innovative measures taken to mediate, negotiate and reformulate cultural binaries. This is typified by the Amazigh political movement, seeking to directly respond to the erasure of Berber culture from mainstream narratives of the Arab Maghreb by delineating and celebrating Amazigh cultural and historical specificities.¹⁷⁹ The inclusion of the Touareg within the movement can be characterised as constructive or ‘imaginative,’ in the same way that Benedict Anderson characterises national identity construction, in that Tamasheq-speaking nomadic Touaregs have never previously assumed to share political interests with,

¹⁷⁷ Baz Lecocq, ‘Unemployed intellectuals in the Sahara: The *Teshumara* Nationalist Movement and the Revolutions in Touareg Society’ *IRSH*, 49 (2004) 87-109 (p. 89).

¹⁷⁸ Cynthia Becker, ‘Matriarchal Nomads and Freedom Fighters,’ *Critical Interventions*, 3:1 (2009) 70-101 (p. 70).

¹⁷⁹ Becker, *Matriarchal Nomads*, p. 72.

for example, sedentary Kabyles of northern Algeria. An alternative interpretation of this essentialist, arguably constructed *Amazighité* identity, is an example of what Spivak calls ‘strategic essentialism,’ wherein a group momentarily accepts essentialist tropes as a means to more effectively pursue a chosen political end.¹⁸⁰ In this sense, the colonial notions of the Kabyle Myth and Touareg exceptionalism, rather than just ‘acting upon’ these groups, can be actively subverted and reformulated to serve the political needs of the community.

Within Amazigh political consciousness, the Touareg have come to represent a kind of cultural ‘purity,’ an authentic model of *Amazighité*, owing to their geo-historical distance from the normative effects of Arabization.¹⁸¹ Ostensibly, this narrative inherits the colonial ‘Triangular’ relationship that Pandolfi outlines, wherein the Touareg act as a site of projection and mediation between European and Arab polars.¹⁸² Cynthia Becker argues that this narrative of Touareg ‘purity’ is often exemplified in the celebration of matriarchal structures, which are characterised as representing an egalitarian Amazigh ‘essence’ that has been erased within Northern Amazigh communities by the effects of supposed Arab patriarchy.¹⁸³ Though she concedes that this is indeed a reproduction of the ‘noble savage’ trope delineated within French colonial ethnography of the Touareg, conflating topography and culture in imagining an ‘untouched’ and ‘impenetrable’ cultural purity, Becker argues this romanticisation could have political utility in breaching these prescribed Arab/European polars.¹⁸⁴ Algerian Amazigh activism has traditionally opposed Islamization and Arabization by using the French secular notion of *laïcité*, somewhat reproducing the binarism of religiosity and secularism that once played into the ‘death’ of Touareg exceptionalism, with ethnographers such as Bedier reconfiguring Touareg ‘criminality’ in terms of their religious

¹⁸⁰ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, *Other Asias* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2008) p. 260.

¹⁸¹ Katherine Hoffman and Susan Gilson Miller, *Berbers and Others: Beyond Tribe and Nation in the Maghreb* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2010) p. 208.

¹⁸² Pandolfi, ‘*L’imagerie touarègue.*’

¹⁸³ Becker, ‘Matriarchal Nomads,’ p. 79.

¹⁸⁴ Becker, ‘Matriarchal Nomads,’ p. 88.

fanaticism.¹⁸⁵ The adoption of a secular *laïcité* philosophy potentially reflects a self-imposed code of French respectability, wherein Touareg activism repulses any elements which may indicate, by colonial definitions, ‘fanaticism’ or ‘primitivism.’ In finding indigenous precepts of ‘cultural pluralism and equality,’ namely the tradition of Touareg women operating outside of the domestic space, an arguably more ‘decolonial’ Amazigh activism can be realised; using ‘essentialist’ tropes, but in a strategic manner that innovates, reformulates and aligns traditional cultural norms with modern political movements towards gender equality.¹⁸⁶

III.II The Touareg in ‘World’ Music: A ‘Third Space’, or strategic essentialism?

Whilst Algerian Amazigh activism takes a mostly internal approach of reform within the national community, the repeated insurgency of Malian Touareg militants has resulted in prolific exiled communities in Libya and Algeria; disengaged and disenfranchised entirely from notions of nationality on account of their exile, their activism takes a more transnational approach. In aiming to form fictive national familial networks with other disenfranchised Maghrebi groups, the Touareg ‘lean in’ to notions of their lack of belonging to any one nation; instead, their “deterritorialized” activism offers a political home for any groups who have been subject to exclusionary governmental policy.¹⁸⁷ This is exemplified in the transnational appeal of Tinariwen (literally translated as the plural to *Ténéré*, desert), a musical ensemble whose founding members participated in the 1990 Touareg rebellion.¹⁸⁸ Whilst taking cues from other Maghrebi protest musicians – such as Morocco’s Nass el Ghiwane, who used *chaabi* musical forms to covertly critique the Moroccan regime during its repressive *années de plomb* (1960s-1980s) – Tinariwen’s musical fusions seem acutely aware of the exoticism with which Western audiences will receive their music. In fusing lyrics and

¹⁸⁵ See: Bédier, *Le Sahara-Niger*, p. 7-9.

¹⁸⁶ Becker, ‘Matriarchal Nomads,’ p. 89.

¹⁸⁷ Becker, ‘Matriarchal Nomads,’ p. 79.

¹⁸⁸ Barry Shank, ‘Unpopular Culture and the American Reception of Tinariwen,’ in *Unpopular Culture*, ed. by Martin Lütke, Sascha Pöhlmann (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University press, 2016) p. 230.

rhythms ‘rooted in a local heritage’ with blues and psychedelia, the music invokes a countercultural and transnational association with ‘global black music with the drive for human emancipation.’¹⁸⁹ Tinariwen succeeds in providing for contradictory appetites within the Western consumption of ‘World’ music for both cultural purity and authenticity, and the ability of the listener to interpret meaning – leading Joe Tangari in *Pitchfork* to declare their sound ‘at once exotic and familiar.’¹⁹⁰ This intertextual relationship between global and local influence exemplifies Homi Bhabha’s notion of the innovative ‘Third Space,’ wherein historically marginalised groups subvert and innovate culturally hegemonic influences to transcend the postcolonial ‘condition’ of perpetual subjectivity.¹⁹¹

Tinariwen’s 2016 song *Ténéré Tàqqàl* (*What has become of the Ténéré*) is an culmination of these notions of strategic essentialism and ‘Third Space’ innovation; the video conflates space, culture and topography in representing the *ishumar* as a camel, carrying a traditional compass, tea making apparatus and guitars and amplifiers in tandem (Figures 11-18). In a simplified narrative of survivalism – the darkness consuming the *ténéré* perhaps a stand in for resource extraction, political corruption, or religious extremism (Figures 14 & 15) – the *ishumar* uses the encroaching darkness to project essentialized iconographies of Touareg culture – the noble warrior and the matriarch (Fig 16-18).¹⁹² Here, the representative power of strategic essentialism is made apparent; by leaning into the irreality and exoticism of Touareg cultural norms to a Western gaze, Tinariwen can claim ownership of and project a succinct narrative of cultural survivalism to a transnational audience, acting in direct resistance to the marginality of the Touareg under Malian nationhood.

The way in which Tinariwen present themselves in Western spaces also reveals a self-consciousness about the ways in which their bodies have been displayed in the colonial past.

¹⁸⁹ Shank, ‘Unpopular Culture’ p. 231.

¹⁹⁰ Shank, ‘Unpopular Culture’ p. 230-231.

¹⁹¹ See: Homi Bhabha, *The location of culture* (New York: Routledge, 1994).

¹⁹² Baz Lecocq, *Disputed Desert: Decolonisation, Competing Nationalisms and Tuareg Rebellions in Northern Mali* (Brill, 2010) p. 4.

Figures 19 & 20 are stills from a live Tinariwen performance at Théâtre des Bouffes du Nord, Paris (2011); in a space representing ‘classical’ French civilisation (established in 1876), Tinariwen retain their veils and traditional costumes, self-consciously emphasising their difference in a similar process of decontextualisation as Atgier’s *Les Touaregs à Paris* (1909).¹⁹³ Displaced from a desert climate that would warrant this practice of veiling, the only remaining function of Touareg dress in this setting is the communication of a sense of cultural pride. This act of embodying ethnic difference could also be interpreted as a form of strategic essentialism; in pre-empting the Western gaze viewing their dress as inherently ‘Other’ and exotic, Tinariwen uses these essentialist tropes to embody cultural difference and invert the punitive and depersonalising Touareg exhibitions of the colonial era.¹⁹⁴

The role of language in Tinariwen’s music is also indicative of broader postcolonial debates between ‘global’ and ‘local’ influences; aside from some Anglophone guest appearances – such as Tenere Taqqim Tossam (2017): ‘*O Tenere! A jealous desert! Why can't you see? You are a treasure, I've seen the world, I love you better*’ – the absence of more transnational, ‘accessible’ languages certainly represent a strategic decision on the part of Tinariwen. Within the history of postcolonial Africa, language often played a potent political role in representing either an embracement or rejection of turbulent colonial pasts. Chinua Achebe notably advocated for a ‘new English,’ allowing not only for transnational and pan-African communication and solidarity, but as a reflection of the didactic and intertextual relationship between English and African linguistic elements that is so often excluded from dominant histories of English literature.¹⁹⁵ Ngugi wa Thiong’o rejected this notion; he argued not only does one’s native language carry a unique representation of a cultural history and heritage, but emphasises the instrumental role of colonial linguistic

¹⁹³ See: Atgier, *Les Touaregs à Paris*.

¹⁹⁴ Spivak, *Other Asias*, *ibid*.

¹⁹⁵ Chinua Achebe, ‘The African writer and the English language’, in *Morning Yet on Creation Day*, ed. by Chinua Achebe (London: Doubleday, 1975), p. 103.

education in creating the psychological ‘alienation’ from one’s own culture that Fanon delineates.¹⁹⁶ Tinariwen’s almost exclusive use of Tamasheq in their music reflects their alignment with Thiong’o’s thinking; not only does Tamacheq preserve collective Touareg cultural histories in their original expression, but it also rejects the notion that their narratives must necessarily be transfigured and tempered by French, English or Arabic translation to attain value.

Despite retaining a deep sense of local and cultural specificity to their music, Tinariwen have nonetheless allowed themselves to become an amalgamated image for trans-Saharan solidarity and emancipation. Figures 21-23 are stills from *Sastanàqqàm (I question you)* (2017), wherein founding members of Tinariwen symbolically transmit their expertise to a group of young musicians from the southern Moroccan town of M’hamid el Ghizlane:

But first the members of Tinariwen wrapped new turbans around the heads of their young acolytes, marking not only the passage from boyhood to manhood according to ancient desert custom, but also the transmission of their music across the generations, a transmission that is taking place in the hearts of youth from every corner of the great Sahara.

Again, the context of predominant Western narratives of ‘Third World’ cultures as being in a perpetual bind between ‘tradition’ and ‘modernity’ is significant here; Tinariwen defy this false dichotomy by using ancient custom to confer a modern political message of transnational and transethnic solidarity.¹⁹⁷ It dispenses with the French colonial insistence of Touareg exceptionalism by using their cultural symbology c the veil – to metaphorically transmit their music, and by extension, their activism for emancipation, to other

¹⁹⁶ Ngugi wa Thiong’o, ‘The African Writer and the Language of African Literature’ in *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory*, ed. by Patrick Williams and Laura Chrisman (London: Routledge, 2013) pp. 435-478 (p. 451).

¹⁹⁷ Connell, *Rethinking Gender from the South*, *ibid.*

disenfranchised peoples regardless of ethnicity, genealogies or religiosity. Ultimately, the didactic relationship that Tinariwen's body of work has with polarising binaries of tradition/modernity, global/local and national/transnational exemplify the innovation that Homi Bhabha calls 'Third Space;' a liminal, performative space wherein previously rigid, immutable and irreconcilable binary oppositions are mediated and inverted.¹⁹⁸ There is an additional element of strategy that Spivak describes; in selectively employing methods of decontextualisation and essentialism, that have their roots in faulty colonial ethnographies, Tinariwen creates a simplified but potent message of emancipation, easily 'exportable' to both Western viewers and to advocate trans-Saharan solidarity. Ultimately, this complex picture of Touareg responses to colonial myths that permeated into the postcolonial era reveal a core facet of their cultural politics that the colonial lens failed to detect; an innovative ability to subvert, transcend and mitigate prescribed boundaries of race, place and culture.

¹⁹⁸ Homi Bhabha, *The location of culture* (New York: Routledge, 1994)

Conclusion

To conclude, we return to Hall's assessment of the Touareg in the colonial ethnographic *imaginaire*: 'I cannot think of a people other than the Touareg from whom so much was expected on the basis of so little actual exposure and experience.'¹⁹⁹ In highlighting the dissonance between these expectations and the reality of Touareg multiplicity and agency, particularly in Chapters II and III, this dissertation finds that ethnographic knowledge construction used any theoretical tools available to construct what Trumbull calls a 'corpus of magical incantations' attempting to form a protective epistemological shield around the inequities and excesses of colonialism.²⁰⁰ Despite being cloaked in the aesthetics of universalism and the scientific method, the ethnographic 'turn' against the Touareg encapsulates the extent to which the colonial ethnographic subject was a mere vessel for contemporary debates of colonial power. Ultimately, the material impacts of the Flatters Expedition were, when placed in its proper historical context, negligible; it amounted to a very minor breach of French military authority that did not majorly impede long-term French expansion into the Sahara. Therefore, the fact that this event was extrapolated into an explosive debate that dichotomized French 'martyrs of geography' against the deceitful criminality of the Touareg reflected the insecurity of French self-esteem far more than any secret Touareg 'conspiracy.' In this sense, the death of Touareg exceptionalism represented collateral damage as a result of an extreme 'reclosure' of Frenchness following the shift to civilian rule in 1871; recoiling at the failure of a utopian Franco-Algerian 'new race,' any ethnographic narratives that showed the humiliating remnants of this earlier attempt at proximity with indigenous peoples was necessarily torn down.

¹⁹⁹ Hall, *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa*, 109.

²⁰⁰ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 263.

The Touareg myth was deeply entangled in the personal and professional prestige of individual men; these two distinct versions of ethnographies of the Touareg are often immortalised in the tragic death of Colonel-Lieutenant Flatters (1881) and the subsequent suicide of Henri Duveyrier (1892). In the aftermath of the Flatters affair, these men's legacies were taken to represent a type of 'martyrdom' that was perceived as the result of a naive expectation of 'humanity' from indigenous subjects. Though both Flatters and Duveyrier's approach to the Touareg was indeed naive in a multitude of ways – namely, the epistemic ability to assess the Touareg on their own terms, which was a feature of colonial discourse itself rather than any particular personal approach – this was, in fact, more of a reflection of the mournful and bitter societal shift that resulted from the French modification *mission civilisatrice* from 'assimilation' to 'association.' Though in the colonial mind, this was a result of the uncooperative and inherently 'deviant' nature of indigenous Algerians; from a postcolonial perspective, we may interpret this failure as an early indigenous rejection of the aspirations to 'sameness' embodied by the *mission civilisatrice*. This rejection would later crystallize in the Algerian War for Independence (1954-62), with political thinkers such as Franz Fanon advocating for the deliberate return to 'primitive' cultural expression as a direct resistance to French colonial politics of respectability. Though this notion was certainly not articulated as a political idea in the era we are discussing (1880s-1910s), accounts such as Lieutenant Hourst's glean early cracks in the previously self-evident validity of the aspiration of indigenous conformity to a strict French model of society and behaviour.

The notion of memorialisation is significant in the postcolonial perspective on intellectual history; Trumbull points to the fact that both Duveyrier and Flatters were immortalised at the *Exposition Universelle* (1900) as bronze busts, representing the 'the great names of French Colonisation.'²⁰¹ This immortalisation perfectly exemplifies a core thesis

²⁰¹ Trumbull IV, *An Empire of Facts*, p. 261.

that has been explored in this dissertation; that whilst both men represented, to their scholarly and military contemporaries, virtually oppositional approaches to Franco-indigenous interaction –Duveyrier embodying a participative ‘closeness’ to the Touareg, with Flatters’ fate serving as a potent argument against such proximity – they were both nonetheless immortalised as contributing greatly to the perpetuation of colonial power. Therefore, colonial knowledge of the Touareg, ‘sympathetic’ or otherwise, not only relied upon the ‘idea of having an empire,’ but actively legitimated this idea with whichever methodological and narrative tools were most socially and academically pertinent to use at the time.

Notably absent from the *Exhibition Universelle* were any allusions to the Touareg ethnographic subjects, interpreters, guides, and insurgents that played a crucial role throughout the history of this construction of knowledge about themselves. This proves the Subaltern historiographical contention that the ‘rule of colonial difference’ was baked into not only colonial discourse, but its mechanisms, institutions and methods, including history and public memory; the stark contrast of bronze likenesses of Duveyrier and Flatters against the namelessness and facelessness of the Touareg exemplifies this colonial difference. In exploring Touareg self-perceptions and self-expressions in Chapter III, a new methodological approach that rejects the veracity of this colonial myth of difference and hierarchy has been explored. The multiplicitous and intelligent uses, rejections and subversions of these inherited colonial myths by cultural ‘ambassadors’ such as Tinariwen reveal the inherent defects of the colonial lens in underestimating and undermining the agency of indigenous peoples. The didactic and innovative relationship between the Touareg and these inherited binaries also reveal a less pessimistic postcolonial outlook than perhaps those of Fanon and Spivak; instead of ‘glossing over’ painful colonial pasts, they can be interacted with in a

liminal 'Third Space,' and used and inverted strategically to advocate for political emancipation in the postcolonial nation.

Covid-19 Considerations

This dissertation was fairly significantly impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic; principally, I was relying on History funding towards a research trip to London, the confirmation of which arrived late (24.02.20). Since I would not be available to make the trip until the Easter holidays, it became impossible as the pandemic progressed – particularly after the announcement of the initial lockdown (23.02.20). I also considered ordering key texts through the Library's document supply request system, which was initially planned to continue after the closure of the University's libraries, but this was also discontinued (20.03.20). The breadth of the Primary Sources used to support Chapters I and II are therefore limited; although the first chapter benefits from a focus on Duveyrier and Daumas as their works were very instrumental, I feel Chapter II may lack a range of sources to fully support the argument of a definitive 'turn' in the ethnographic literature of the Touareg.

The following is a sample of the most important texts I have failed to gain access to:

Barth, Heinrich, *Fous du désert: Les premiers explorateurs du Sahara 1849-1887* (Paris: Phébus, 1991)

Benhazera, M., *Six Mois chez les Touareg du Ahaggar*, (Alger: Jourdan, 1908)

Blancard, Pascal, *L'autre et nous: Scenes et types* (Paris: Syros, ACHAC, 1995)

Favard, C., *France africaine. Sahara et Soudan, essai sur la mise en valeur du Sahara et sur les communications du centre africain avec l'Europe*, (Paris, 1905)

Ferne, Albert, *Le Touareg* (Paris, 1900)

Joseph Richer, Ange Marie, *Les Touareg du Niger* (Paris, E. Larose, 1924)

Peres, Gustav, *L'Islam et ses anarchistes: Les Tidjanys, les Senoussiim, les Berbers voiles* (1893)

Rodd, Francis Rennell, *People of the veil; being an account of the habits, organisation and history of the wandering Tuareg tribes which inhabit the mountains of Air, or Asben in the Central Sahara* (London: Macmillan, 1926)

Tai, Li-Chuan, *L'anthropologie française entre sciences coloniales et décolonisation (1880-1960)* (Paris: Publications de la Société française d'histoire d'outre-mer, 2010)

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Visual Sources:

Submitted in separate document to Dr Claire Eldridge via email.

Print Sources:

Atgier, Paul, 'Les Touaregs à Paris,' *Bulletins et Mémoires de la Société d'Anthropologie de Paris*, 10 (1909) 222-243.

Aucapitaine, Henri, 'Notions ethnographiques sur les berbères Touaregs,' *Le Globe: Revue genevoise de géographie*, 4 (1864) 1-53.

Aymard, Capitaine, *Les Touareg* (Paris: Librairie Hachette, 1911)

Bédier, G-D, *Le Sahara-Niger, ou Transsaharien: Conférence faite à Paris devant le Comité de l'Afrique du Nord* (Paris: Challamel & Co, 1888)

Bissuel, Henri, *Le Sahara français: conférence sur les questions sahariennes* (Alger: Jourdan, 1891)

Daumas, Eugène, *La femme arabe* (Alger: A. Jourdan, 1912)

Daumas, Eugène, *La Grande Kabylie* (Paris: Hachette, 1847)

Daumas, Eugène, *Le Sahara algérien: études géographiques, statistiques et historiques sur la région au sud des établissements français en Algérie* ed. by Chancel de Ausone (Paris: Langlois et Leclercq, 1845)

Demage, *À travers le Sahara* (Paris: Hachette, 1903)

De Tocqueville, Alexis, 'Essay on Algeria, October 1941' in *Writings on Empire and Slavery* ed. and trans by Jennifer Pitts (Baltimore, Maryland: John Hopkins University Press, 2001)

Duveyrier, Henri, *Les Touareg du Nord* (Paris: Challamel aîné, 1864)

Duveyrier, Henri, *Sahara algérien et tunisien. Journal de route de Henri Duveyrier*, published and annotated by Ch. Maunoir et H. Schirmer, ed. by Augustin Challamel (Paris: Librairie Maritime et Coloniale, 1905)

Flatters, Paul François Xavier, *Histoire de la géographies et géologie de la province de Constantine* (1865)

Hurst, Emile, *Sur le Niger et au pays des Touaregs: la mission Hurst, par le lieutenant de vaisseau Hurst* (Paris: Librairie Plon, 1898)

Mercier, Ernest, *La France dans le Sahara et au Soudan* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1889)

National Liberation Front, 'Proclamation, November 1, 1954'

Périer, Jean-André-Napoléon, 'Des races dites berbères et de leur ethnogénie,' *Mémoires de la société d'anthropologie* (1873) 1-54.

Senatus Consulte, 14 July 1865, and *Accompanying Regulations*, 21 April 1866.

The Cremieux Decree, 24th October 1870.

Secondary Sources

Achebe, Chinua, 'The African writer and the English language', in *Morning Yet on Creation Day*, ed. by Chinua Achebe (London: Doubleday, 1975)

Alalou, Ali, 'Language and Ideology in the Maghreb: Francophonie and Other Languages,' *French Review*, 80:2 (2006) 408-421.

Allaoua, Malek, *Le Harem Colonial: Images d'un sous-érotisme* (Seguier: Paris, 2001)

Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (Verso: London, 2006)

Arneil, Barbara, 'John Locke, Natural Law and Colonialism,' *History of Political Thought*, 13:4 (1992) 587-603.

Arondekar, Anjali, 'Without a Trace: Sexuality and the Colonial Archive', *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, 14:½ (2005) 10-27.

Becker, Cynthia, 'Matriarchal Nomads and Freedom Fighters,' *Critical Interventions*, 3:1 (2009) 70-101.

Bennett, Tony, 'The Exhibitionary Complex,' *New Formations* 4:1 (1998) 73-102.

Bhabha, Homi, *The location of culture* (New York: Routledge, 1994)

Chatterjee, Partha, *The Nation and Its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993)

Clancy-Smith, Julia, 'La femme Arabe: Women and Sexuality in France's North African Empire', in *Women, the Family and Divorce Laws in Islamic History*, ed. by Amira Sonbol (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1996), pp. 52-63.

Classen, Constance and Howes, David, 'The Museum as Sensescape: Western Sensibilities and Indigenous Artefacts' in *Sensible Objects : Colonialism, Museums and Material Culture*, ed. by Elizabeth Edwards, et al., (Bloomsbury Publishing, 2006) pp. 199-222.

Cohn, Bernard S, *Colonialism and its forms of knowledge: the British in India* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996).

- Comte, Auguste, *Discours sur l'ensemble du positivisme* (reissued by Cambridge University Press, 2009)
- Conklin, Alice L., *In the Museum of Man: Race, Anthropology, and Empire in France, 1850-1950* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2013)
- Davis, Diana K., 'Desert 'wastes' of the Maghreb: desertification narratives in French colonial environmental history of North Africa,' *Cultural Geographies*, 11:4 (2004) 359-387.
- Djebar, Assia, 'Forbidden Gaze, Severed Sound I' in *Women of Algiers in their Apartment*, ed. By Assia Djebar (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1992) pp. 133-151.
- Evans, Martin, and Phillips, John, 'Darling of the Non-Aligned Movement, 1962-78' in *Anger of the Dispossessed* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007)
- Fanon, Frantz, *Black Skin, White Masks* (London: Pluto Press, 1986)
- Foucault, Michel, *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison* (New York: Vintage Books, 1977)
- Foucault, Michel, *The Archeology of Knowledge and the Discourse on Language* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972)
- Foucault, Michel, *The Will to Knowledge: The History of Sexuality Volume 1* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978) (trans. Robert Hurley)
- Greenhalgh, Michael, 'The New Centurions: French Reliance on the Roman Past During the Conquest of Algeria,' *War & Society*, 16:1 (1998) 1-28.
- Hall, Bruce S., *A History of Race in Muslim West Africa, 1600-1960* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014)
- Heffernan, Michael, 'The Limits of Utopia: Henri Duveyrier and the Exploration of the Sahara in the Nineteenth Century,' *The Geographical Journal*, 155:3 (1989) 342-352.
- Hoffman, Katherine and Gilson Miller, Susan, *Berbers and Others: Beyond Tribe and Nation in the Maghreb* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2010)
- Kiernan, Ben, *Blood and Soil: A World History of Genocide and Extermination from Sparta to Darfur* (New Haven, Conn: Yale University Press, 2007)
- Klute, George, and Lecocq, Baz, 'Tuareg Separatism in Mali,' *International Journal*, 63:3 (2013) 424-434.
- Kohl, Ines, 'Modern Nomads, Vagabonds, or Cosmopolitans? Reflections on Contemporary Touareg Society' *Journal of Anthropological Research*, 66:4 (2010) 449-462.
- Lecocq, Baz, *Disputed Desert: Decolonisation, Competing Nationalisms and Tuareg Rebellions in Northern Mali* (Brill, 2010)

Lecocq, Baz, 'Unemployed intellectuals in the Sahara: The *Teshumara* Nationalist Movement and the Revolutions in Touareg Society' *IRSH*, 49 (2004) 87-109.

Lloyd, T., 'Thuggee, Marginality and the State Effect in Colonial India, circa 1770–1840', *Indian Economic and Social Review*, 45:2 (2008) 201-237.

Lorcin, Patricia, *Imperial Identities: Stereotyping, Prejudice and Race in Colonial Algeria* (London: I. B. Tauris, 1999)

Lorcin, Patricia, 'Imperialism, Colonial Identity, and Race in Algeria, 1830-1870: The Role of the French Medical Corps,' *Isis*, 90:4 (1999) 653-679.

Michaud, Jean, "*Incidental*" *Ethnographers: French Catholic Missionson the Tonkin-Yunnan Frontier, 1880-1930* (Leiden, 2007).

Moore, Lindsey, "'Darkly as through a veil': reading representations of Algerian women,' *Intercultural Education*, 18:4 (2007) 335-351.

Niang, Amy, 'The Political Economy of Ransoming in the Sahel: The History, The Ethics and the Practice,' *African Economic History*, 42 (2014) 157-183.

Norris, Harry T., *The Tuaregs: Their Islamic Legacy and Its Diffusion in the Sahel* (London: Warminster, 1976)

Núñez, Rachel, 'Rethinking Universalism: Olympe Audouard, Hubertine Auclert, and the Gender Politics of the Civilizing Mission,' *French Politics, Culture & Society*, 30:1 (2012) 23-45

Pandolfi, Paul, 'Imaginaire colonial et littérature: Jules Verne chez les Touaregs,' *Revue ethnologies comparées*, 5 (2002).

Pandolfi, Paul, 'La Construction du myth Touareg: Quelques remarques et hypothèses,' *Revue ethnologies comparées*, 7 (2004)

Pandolfi, Paul, 'Les Touaregs et nous: Une relation triangulaire,' *Revue ethnologies comparées*, 2 (2001)

Pandolfi, Paul, 'L'imagerie touarègue entre littérature savante et littérature populaire' *L'Année du Maghreb*, 7 (2011) 101-113.

Pitts, Jennifer, 'Tocqueville and the Algeria Question,' in *A Turn to Empire: The Rise of Imperial Liberalism in Britain and France* ed. by Jenifer Pitts (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009)

Prochaska, David, 'The Archive of *Algérie Imaginaire*', *History & Anthropology* 4:2 (1990), 373-420.

Rasmussen, Susan J., 'Tuareg' in *Encyclopedia of World Culture, Volume 9: Africa and the Middle East*, ed. by David Levinson (London: G K Hall, 1996).

- Said, Edward, *Orientalism* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1978)
- Shank, Barry, 'Unpopular Culture and the American Reception of Tinariwen,' in *Unpopular Culture*, ed. by Martin Lüthe, Sascha Pöhlmann (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University press, 2016)
- Sherman, Daniel J., "The Arts and Sciences of Colonialism," *French Historical Studies*, 23:4 (2000) 707-729.
- Silverstein, Paul A., 'France's *Mare Nostrum*: colonial and post-colonial constructions of the French Mediterranean,' *The Journal of North African Studies*, 7:4 (2000) 1-22.
- Skinner, Ryan Thomas, 'Cultural Politics in the Post-Colony: Music, Nationalism and Statism in Mali, 1964-75' *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, 82:4 (2012), 511-534.
- Smith, Anna Marie, 'Powellism: the black immigrant as the post-colonial symptom and the phantasmatic re-closure of the British nation' in *New Right discourse on race and sexuality: Britain, 1968-1990* ed. by Anna Marie Smith (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994).
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty, *Can the Subaltern Speak?* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1988)
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty, *Other Asias* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2008)
- Staum, Martin S., *Labelling People: French Scholars on Society, Race and Empire 1815-1848* (London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2003)
- Staum, Martin S., 'Nature and Nurture in French Ethnography and Anthropology, 1859-1914,' *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 65: 3 (2004) 475-495.
- Strachan, John, 'Murder in the Desert: Soldiers, Settlers and the Flatters Expedition in the Politics and Historical Memory of European Colonial Algeria, 1830-1881' *French History and Civilization*, 4:1 (2011) 210-222.
- Thiong'o, Ngugi wa, 'The African Writer and the Language of African Literature' in *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory*, ed. by Patrick Williams and Laura Chrisman (London: Routledge, 2013)
- Trumbull IV, George R., *An Empire of Facts: Colonial Power, Cultural Knowledge, and Islam in Algeria, 1870-1914* (Cambridge; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2009)
- Weiss, Gillian, *Captives and Corsairs: France and Slavery in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2011)